

# Moderating Effects Of Performance Management On The Relationship Between Transformational Leadership And Clergy Effectiveness In PAG In Uganda

Omara George Joel, Nguchie Gathogo, Nathan Chiroma

*Doctor Of Philosophy Student, Pan African Christian University, Kenya*  
*Lecturer, Department Of Leadership Studies, Pan Africa Christian University, Kenya*  
*Professor Of Practical Theology, Africa College Of Theology, Rwanda*

---

## **Abstract**

*This study investigated the moderating effects of performance management on the relationship between transformational leadership and clergy effectiveness in the Pentecostal Assemblies of God (PAG) in Uganda. Addressing performance issues among PAG clergy, including shortcomings in discipleship, baptism, counseling, visitations, church planting, and financial management, the research employed a mixed-methods approach using questionnaires to collect data from a sample of 311 clergy members selected through cluster multistage random sampling from a population of 5,027. Data analysis utilizing Stata Version 18 for quantitative analysis and NVivo Version 14 for qualitative analysis revealed that performance management factors significantly moderated the relationship between transformational leadership and clergy effectiveness, with the model explaining 51.59% of the variance when including background characteristics. The findings showed that individualized consideration ( $b = 0.2153, p = 0.020$ ) and inspirational motivation ( $b = 0.2791, p = 0.007$ ) were significant positive predictors of clergy effectiveness, while performance management factors such as feedback ( $b = 0.1774, p = 0.005$ ) and improvement plans ( $b = 0.4233, p = 0.000$ ) enhanced effectiveness, though appraisal ( $b = -0.3331, p = 0.000$ ) showed a negative association. Age emerged as a significant negative predictor ( $b = -16.4182, p = 0.000$ ), indicating additional challenges for older clergy members. The study recommends implementing structured performance management systems emphasizing positive feedback and improvement planning while being mindful of the potential negative impacts of formal appraisals and providing additional support for older clergy members.*

**Keywords:** *Transformational Leadership, Performance Management, Clergy Effectiveness, PAG Uganda, Church Leadership*

---

Date of Submission: 22-02-2025

Date of Acceptance: 02-03-2025

---

## **I. Introduction**

According to Yukl (2013), transformational leadership and charismatic leadership emerged as the outcome of management researchers in the 1980s getting interested in the emotional and symbolic aspects of leadership. The rationale of transformational leadership thinking was that the emotional processes help explain how leaders influence followers to make self-sacrifices and put the needs of the mission or organization above their materialistic self-interests.

Defining transformational leadership has never been an easy task, but the term transformation means to change the nature and function or condition of something or a person (Chammas & Hernandez, 2019; Northouse, 2016). This leadership style, therefore, is used to describe how effective leaders inspire and transform followers by appealing to their ideals and emotions (Yukl, 2013). These leaders broaden and elevate the interests of their employees by generating awareness and acceptance of the purposes and mission of the group and stirring employees to look beyond their self-interest for the good of the group which consequently leads to additional effort and greater productivity (Bass, 1990; Kets de Vries et al, 2016; Northouse, 2016).

Torlak and Kuzey (2019) aver that transformational leadership involves demonstrating charisma through formulating a vision; indoctrinating a vision through words and symbols, encouraging followers to fully utilize their creative ideas and share them in task performance, and promoting a strong bond with the individuals whose desire for self-development is boosted. Transformational leadership is thought to be one of the most influential leadership styles that brings out positive outcomes from the employees and subsequently the organization (Kotamena et al., 2020). This is because transformational leaders leverage employee engagement, commitment, and performance because of their visionary, charismatic, and supportive characteristics. Further, these leaders provide consistent encouragement and motivation through quality communication between leader and followers that enhances the developments in the company (Torlak & Kuzey, 2019).

In the views of Jensen et al. (2016), transformational leadership occurs when individual employees are directed and inspired to transform and motivate them. Through motivation, transformational leadership seeks to

satisfy employees' higher order needs to engage them in attaining the organizational goals. Transformational leadership style offers a leader the potential to optimize individual orientation to achieve their organizational goals, not necessarily for their own selfish needs but for the broader good of the organization (Kotamena et al., 2020). To that same thought, Jensen et al. (2016) continue to argue that the transformational leadership concept captures leaders' systematic effort to transform employees to share organizational goals. These leaders motivate followers not by the social exchange and mutual benefits that transactional leaders provide but by raising the consciousness of their followers and inspiring them to pursue an energizing and unifying higher cause (Kotamena et al., 2020). It is important to note that the motivation is not self-interest but the pursuit of a collective goal. Given the foregone thought, transformational leaders create meaning that enables followers to identify with these leaders and internalize their vision.

Andriani et al. (2018) state that transformational leadership is true leadership because it works toward a target and action which directs the organization towards a goal that has never been achieved before. They contend that since transformational leaders' direct organizations to new frontiers, they foster needed change in organizations that motivate the subordinates to be willing to work for the high-level targets that are considered beyond their interests at the time. This agrees with Top et al. (2020) who identify transformational leadership as one of the styles of leadership in which the leader identifies the need for change, and creates a vision to guide the change through inspiration, and positive conduct for increased commitment of the members in the organization. Giddens (2018) reinforces the idea by stating that this leadership style is characterized by the ability to stimulate, inspire, and motivate followers. Furthermore, these leaders focus on building relationships with people and creating change by emphasizing values.

Compared to other leadership styles, transformational leadership enjoys a lot of focus in leadership scholarship because certain behaviors of transformational leaders can arouse followers to a higher level of thinking and motivate followers to go beyond the minimum requirements of their job descriptions, resulting in higher levels of contextual performance (Reza, 2019). When followers are inspired to share a vision, empowered to achieve the vision, and are provided the resources necessary for raising their potential, then we say transformational leadership has occurred. Such leaders are iconic because they positively motivate their followers and link employees' sense of self with the structural values of their organization. They also focus on the organization's values such as freedom, integrity, peace, and equality which are higher ideals and values that transform organizational culture (Reza, 2019). The culture and values increase the consciousness of followers to a higher purpose as they focus on the long-term goals of the organization (Chen et al., 2020).

Through high ideals and values, the employees are motivated to exert greater effort that boosts organizational performance (Carreiro & Oliveira, 2019; Yamin, 2020) as it inspires employees' passion, (Jia et al., 2018), creativity and innovation (Asbari et al., 2020; Hui et al., 2018; Shafi et al., 2020), effective communication, and cross-cultural leadership (Bonsu, 2018), and change management (Suliman & Alqatawenh, 2018). Furthermore, transformational leadership promotes higher evaluations of promotability due to higher perceptions of leaders' communality and leadership effectiveness (Hentschel et al., 2018).

### **The components of transformational leadership**

Ghasabeh and Provitera (2017) state that transformational leadership consists of four components: idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation, and individualized consideration. These components are also described as the four behaviors needed to practice transformational leadership (Al-Husseini & Elbeltagi, 2018). It is also referred to as the factors of transformational leadership according to Northouse (2016) and includes idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation, and individualized consideration. When carried out correctly, the four dimensions of transformational leadership can enhance the effectiveness which aids productivity (Ghasabeh & Provitera, 2017). The explanations of these dimensions are briefly described below.

Idealized influence enables leaders to act as solid role models for their followers due to their extraordinary capabilities and high doctrines of ethical conduct (Reza, 2019). It facilitates the leader to express confidence in the organizational vision and instill trust, respect, admiration, and faith among organizational members (Al-husseini & Elbeltagi, 2018). Such leaders foster cooperation among their followers (Reza, 2019) as they exhibit charisma and convey a clear vision and mission for their company (Jacob et al., 2017). Idealized influence also encompasses the construct of power, confidence, trust, and respect which form essential components of a strong relationship between leader and subordinate (Jacob et al., 2017).

Inspirational motivation, which is the second component, involves leaders' ability to motivate followers so that they can perform beyond the expectations. They do this by motivating those around them by giving meaning and challenge to their followers (Reza, 2019) to increase effort toward meeting shared and agreed upon organizational goals which in ordinary situations look difficult or even impossible ( Al-husseini & Elbeltagi, 2018; Jacob et al., 2017). These leaders build relationships with their followers through interactive communication which results in team spirit among organizational members.

Intellectual stimulation essentially involves the leader stimulating the followers to think through issues and problems for themselves and thus develop their abilities (Jacob et al., 2017; Reza, 2019). It is concerned with the role of leaders to challenge creativity and innovation among followers, as followers are encouraged to try new approaches, and their ideas are not criticized because they differ from the leaders' ideas. This factor of transformational leadership denotes the degree to which leaders stimulate their followers to try new approaches and re-examine and challenge existing assumptions. Leaders who demonstrate this component are champions in the empowerment and continuous improvement of followers or people (Al-Husseini & Elbeltagi, 2018). Through intellectual stimulation, a leader demonstrates new ways of viewing problems to subordinates as well as teaching problem-solving techniques and highlighting rational solutions (Carreiro & Oliveira, 2019; Jacob et al., 2017). When a leader functions in this way, it increases the capacities of the followers to conceptualize, understand, and analyze problems and improve the qualities of the solutions they generate.

The element of individualized consideration of transformational leadership refers to the realization that a leader motivates followers to arrive at their particular potential and supply those required sources for development (Khalil & Sahibzadah, 2021). This component enables a pastor to hear and listen to the concerns of congregational members and to consider the individual needs of their followers, as they demonstrate concern for those needs in both word and deed (Gregory, 2019). This enables a pastor to act as both counselor and coach in helping congregants with their needs, so that they may reach a level of self-actualization, where they can fulfill their God-given call.

The component of individualized consideration enables transformational leaders to give special attention to each follower's needs for achievement and growth. (Jacob et al., 2017). Through this component, a leader creates new learning opportunities and creates a supportive climate for individual staff (Reza, 2019) because they are aware of their followers' needs and concerns as individuals, and develop their strengths through coaching and consulting (Alqatawenh, 2018; Bass & Riggio, 2006; Bin Atan & Mahmood, 2019). Bin Atan and Mahmood (2019) call this component empowerment because it enables the leader to delegate employees to respond directly to problems which in turn empowers and raises the capacity of the employees to be better in what they do.

### **The arguments against transformational leadership**

Several weaknesses are noticed in transformational leadership. One criticism raised against transformational leadership is that it lacks conceptual clarity (Ghasabeh & Provitera, 2017; Northouse, 2016). It is argued that the transformational leadership concept is vague because it covers a wide range of activities and characteristics such as creating a vision, motivating, being a change agent, building trust, giving nurturance, and acting as a social architect. On that note, therefore, it is difficult to define exactly the parameters of transformational leadership since there is an overlap between the four *I*s; therefore, making it difficult to measure. To this criticism, Ghasabeh and Provitera (2017) respond that transformational leadership is easy to understand and implement because transformational leadership is more realistic than some of the other leadership forms. They conclude that since transformational leadership is clear and easy to implement, it has risen to a phenomenon that is worth understanding, learning, and using in organizations around the world (Ghasabeh & Provitera, 2017).

Another criticism is that there is a tendency to view transformational leadership as a personality trait or personal predisposition rather than a behavior that people can learn (Northouse, 2016). If viewed as a trait then, it will be problematic because it is difficult to teach people how to change their traits. Asbari et al. (2020) respond to this criticism by citing work by Bono and Judge (2004) that showed a link between personality and transformational leadership. They cite a study by Barling et al. (1996) which has revealed that transformational leadership can be learned, and transformational leadership training can result not only in increasing transformational behavior, but also in increased employee commitment and performance. In defense of transformational leadership and in response to the accusation that it is a trait theory, Ghasabeh and Provitera (2017) rebut that whereas the thinkers associated with trait theory, believed that a great man has to be born; not made, the four dimensions of transformational leadership are as a way to become or aspire to be a great leader which is in contrast with the great man approach in trait theory.

Another criticism some have made is that transformational leadership is elitist and antidemocratic (Northouse, 2016). The argument is that transformational leaders often play a direct role in creating changes, establishing a vision, and advocating new directions which gives the strong impression that the leader is acting independently of followers or putting himself or herself above the followers' needs. The challenge is that by focusing primarily on the leader, the leader is portrayed as heroic and does not recognize shared leadership or reciprocal influence, because followers can influence leaders just as leaders can influence followers. To this criticism, Asbari et al. (2020) respond that transformational leadership should not be viewed as elitist and heroic because transformational leaders can be directive or participative, and authoritarian or democratic.

Related to the accusation of elitism is the complaint that transformational leadership grants an excess of power to leaders to determine unilaterally both the ends and means of the collective action to which followers are expected to commit themselves. This situation may incentivize leaders toward narcissism and hubris which breeds

authoritarianism. Contrary to this criticism, Kim and Shin (2019) found out that transformational leadership involves an empowering process that intervenes between transformational leadership and organizational outcomes. Further, both the MLQ and the Full Range of Leadership models go beyond the charismatic 'great guy' scenario by placing a lot of emphasis on follower behavior (Asbari, 2020). Meanwhile, charisma is only one part of the concept of transformational leadership and it is moral leadership that serves the good of the group, organization, or country and should not harm followers (Asbari, 2020).

### **The rationale for choosing transformational leadership as an independent variable in this study**

Transformational leadership was suitable in this study because such leaders are aware of their environment and they create wide organizational changes for survival and development for the preferred future (Moradi & Shahbazi, 2016). Given the challenges faced in PAG, there is an urgent need for leaders who can skillfully discern the need for change and lead the organization in that process. The process of change requires relational leaders to keep the teams together to motivate and give clear guidance to everyone involved in the process of change. Transformational leadership offers such qualities since it is an approach to leadership that embraces a relational style of motivating action in employees (Jacob et al; Kindarto et al., 2020).

Transformational leaders' relational and motivational strengths make them effective in terms of individual and team performance, in both private and public sector organizations (Izquierdo et al., 2015; Kindarto et al, 2020; Ohunakin et al., 2019). Through their relational nature, they raise and expand the subordinate's interests and motivation to exert extra efforts for the benefit of the organization (Jacob et al., 2017; Moradi & Shahbazi, 2016; Peng & Tseng, 2019). These leaders are needed because they develop their followers through coaching, modeling, empowering, challenging the status quo, embracing high moral values, and are success-oriented (Ahmad & Saad, 2020; Kindarto et al, 2020; Nawoseing'ollan & Roussel 2017; Otieno & Njoroge 2019; White et al. 2017). PAG, like many other organizations, needs its clergy to be developed to a level where they can lead effectively. It is this quality which has influenced the choice of transformational leadership in this study.

Furthermore, the choice of transformational leadership as an independent variable in this study is important because transformational leaders are good communicators which is a very essential characteristic in casting vision and keeping a team together (Suwandana, 2019). PAG currently needs leaders who are good at effectively communicating vision and building a performing team. In addition to good communication, transformational leaders evaluate existing and prospective innovative practices, use the employees productively without taking advantage of them, apply creativity, accept change, and clearly understand the needs of their organizations (Okere & Olorunfemi, 2018). This is what is currently needed among the clergy of PAG for them to be effective. Transformational leaders have good administrative skills, good listening skills, empathy, emotional support, empowerment, and coaching skills (Okere & Olorunfemi 2018; White et al., 2017). These are the skills that are needed by the clergy in PAG because these skills will enhance a leader's leadership effectiveness.

### **Performance Management**

Most often, there are frequent unpredictable turbulences that exert negative impacts on businesses and organizations (Taouab & Issor, 2019). As of significant importance, organizations need to guard against these waves by regularly assessing and measuring business performance to ensure effective and efficient results. This is achieved by managing the performance of each employee since it affects the overall performance of the organization (Audenaert et al., 2016).

Rao (2016) defined performance management as doing everything necessary to consistently improve the performance of every employee in the context of the organization's short and long-term goals. Audenaert et al. (2021) on their part view employee performance management as a cyclical Human Resource Management (HRM) practice to help employees improve their performance beginning with the planning stage, which involves goal setting; continuing to the intermediate follow-up stage, which involves following up on the progress and providing feedback; and, finally, concluding with the appraisal stage, which involves rating performance. This is related to Aguinis (2019) conceptualization of performance management as a continuous process of identifying, measuring, and developing the performance of individuals and teams and aligning their performance with the strategic goals of the organization. Aguinis explains that performance management identifies and measures both individual and team performance while matching performance with the strategic objectives of the firm.

According to Pina et al. (2018), performance management is a continuous process which helps in identifying, measuring and developing the performance of organization's members and aligning performance with the strategic goals of the organization. In regard to all the organization's activities, performance management considers the human resource style, culture, communication systems, and policy (Nduati & Wanyoike, 2022) and addresses the issue of multiple demands of efficiency and quality service by providing clear guidance, support, and feedback on the performance goals to foster ideas that are worthwhile to implement. (Audenaert et al., 2016).

Regardless of the good intention of performance management, Franco-Santos and Otley (2018) observed that well-intended decisions associated with the process of managing performance oftentimes produced largely unintended consequences. They detected that paradoxically, performance management system aimed at facilitating the delivery of high-quality service ends up creating the opposite perverse outcomes such as gaming, information manipulation, selective attention, the illusion of control, and relationship transformation. Certain reasons for this paradox are that performance management is less a culture of practice than one of ritual since, too much attention is placed on the design of the performance management system, and not enough on how it works when implemented (Pina et al., 2018). However, the key question that performance management addresses is how to develop techniques that will help employees meet their personal goals for growth, development, and personal success that will also help the organization to function more effectively. There is a close relation between the two sides of a person/organization that the techniques of performance management can bridge through effective implementation techniques and sound cultural ideology.

### **Performance Management Dimensions**

Armstrong and Taylor (2014) state that the performance management cycle includes processes of performance planning, managing performance, performance reviews, performance assessment, recording the agreement, and review. The cycle can also be described as goal setting, performance appraisal, feedback, rewarding and improvement plan. Helmold and Terry (2021) designate the performance management cycle as performance measurement and analysis (Plan), the performance action and implementation (Do), the performance management controlling (Check), and the performance improvements and adjustments (Act). Yet still, the cycle is viewed by Schleicher et al. (2018) as tasks and they include the following: setting performance expectations, observing employee performance, integrating performance information, rendering a formal summative performance evaluation, generating and delivering performance feedback, the formal performance review meeting, and performance coaching. In this study, the components of goal setting, performance appraisal, feedback, and rewarding and improvement plan were used. Each of the components is discussed below.

### **Goal Setting**

Goal setting is done at the performance planning stage which is premised on performance agreements. At this stage, expectations and roles are clearly defined with specific key result areas. The key results areas are presented in specific objectives with definite targets matched to the knowledge, skills, and abilities (KSAs) required and the behavioral competencies needed to perform well. Generally, the goal-setting process should align individual goals with the strategic goals of the organization. Al-Khamaiseh et al. (2019) reiterated what Locke and Latham (1990) who stated that what gets measured about goals, gets done because a goal is an object or aim of an action.

For a task to be done, management ought to leverage the collective efforts of each organization member in the same direction, and their contributions must fit together to produce a whole without gaps, friction, and unnecessary duplication of effort (Al-Khamaiseh et al., 2019). Pulakos and O'Leary (2011) further explain the cycle of goal setting as cascading organizational goals to individual employees, setting SMART performance objectives, and rating competencies. The scholars argue that cascading goals help everyone understand how work is related across organizational units and levels, and they also align the work of individuals and units with the organization's direction and priorities. The goals provide customized performance expectations and criteria based on the employee's specific job drive employees to achieve important results, and remove unfair subjectivity from the evaluation process. According to Schleicher et al. (2018b) task clarification and goal setting as part of performance management improve employee performance.

### **Performance Appraisal**

Performance appraisal, also called performance review, is an evaluation technique of creating a solid ground for performance management through a process where the duties and responsibilities of a position are compared with the standards of performance stated in the job description (Agyare et al. 2016; Mahmoud et al., 2019). The management of performance appraisals involves the process of assessing what has been accomplished by individuals as agreed in the set goals and objectives to inform the allocation of rewards (Cappelli & Conyon, 2018). Continuous performance assessments guide staff to act in the interests of the organization through the process of setting direction, monitoring and measuring performance, and taking action accordingly.

However, there is fear that performance appraisals sometimes do not achieve the desired outcome of improving performance because of rater bias. For instance, some supervisors are lenient or harsh in their performance appraisals which can result in rating inaccuracy therefore undermining validity because the true rank ordering among targets is thereby obscured (John, et al., 2016). Cappelli and Conyon (2018) noted measurement as a problem in appraisals because of a challenge in designing the appropriate scales besides the problem of reducing individual biases, which is the effect of individual attributes on the process.

Nevertheless, performance appraisals are now a key element of performance management which has evolved from being an annually reoccurring administrative requirement to a more strategic function within performance management (Walk & Kennedy, 2017). This strategic evolvement of performance appraisal has consequently defined appraisals as a process including the establishment of performance standards, to fulfill a broader, more holistic, function that is tightly integrated into the organizational strategy in the form of performance management systems (Walk & Kennedy, 2017). Therefore, performance assessments are linked to individual, departmental, and organizational goals which give staff a more concrete perception of what is expected from them, and help to direct their efforts towards the goals of the organization which are then reviewed and either rewarded with bonus payments or used as a basis for future promotion decisions (Kampkötter, 2017).

Agyare et al. (2016) state that if there is fairness in the appraisal system, it will result in employees' job satisfaction and promote employees' commitment. Appraisals are fair if they are linked to salary, identification of training needs, clarity of performance appraisal purpose, and employee involvement in the formulation of appraisal tools.

### **Performance Feedback**

One of the major justifications for investing in performance appraisal and performance management systems is that they provide employees with valuable performance feedback (Murphy, 2020). In the view of Steelman and Williams (2019), job performance feedback is essential to development, performance improvement, and goal setting because feedback guides motivates, reinforces effective behavior, and identifies and reduces ineffective behavior. But, on the other hand, recipients may be defensive and dismissive of feedback, particularly negative feedback. Based on the negative reactions to feedback, managers and leaders may delay or distort feedback and are often reluctant to provide critical feedback. Chawla et al. (2016) noted that the staff disliked and dismissed performance feedback. Meanwhile, the supervisors are reluctant to provide tough feedback, and therefore organizations do not enact research findings about improving feedback processes. They argue that discarding performance ratings on these grounds is effectively throwing out the baby with the bath water. Instead, they advocate for an improvement in the delivery and receptivity of feedback.

Aguinis (2013) advises supervisors to regularly offer staff feedback on progression toward goals and coaching to improve performance certainly before the review cycle is over. In the same manner, the staff are also encouraged to solicit performance feedback and coaching from the supervisor before the performance review cycle is over. Chawla et al. (2016) agree with Aguinis' position and state that the best performance management involves regular, ongoing communication with employees by focusing on feedback receptivity because continuous feedback is more likely to change employee behaviors.

### **Performance Rewarding**

Aguinis (2013) advises organizations to move away from more traditional reward systems based mainly on seniority by establishing clear links between performance management and other functions, such as training, because when such links have been established, employees are more likely to see the benefits of the performance management system and believe that the system is fair. He proffers full or partial payment based on performance, where individuals are rewarded based on how well they perform on the job. Mollel et al. (2017) opine that reward serves as the most motivating factor that can propel several organizations to stimulate the productivity of their employees, without which the quality and quantity of services offered by an organization may not be realized. When the performance management system has a direct relationship with the reward system, performance measurement and performance improvement are taken more seriously. In other words, performance pay plans force organizations to define effective performance clearly and to determine what factors are likely to lead to effective performance.

Aguinis (2013) holds that when a performance pay plan is implemented, organizations need to make clear what is expected of employees, what specific behaviors or results will be rewarded, and how employees can achieve these behaviors or results. This, in and of itself, serves an important communication goal because supervisors and employees can understand what matters. Cappelli and Conyon (2018) maintain the relevance of performance appraisal and feedback which results in diverse rewards. They however note that the most important reward is pay increases or merit pay. Kampkötter (2017) confirms that feedback is significant because it may signal to employees that they are being valued by their supervisors and the organization but he maintains that the feedback incidence should convert to economic relevance because it is the economic valence of the feedback which is a predictor of productivity.

### **Performance Improvement Plan**

At the end of the feedback, managers should reach an agreement with each staff member on the result of the analysis, which enables the staff member to understand how they are performing. The area of improvement and expected future performance is recorded as a performance agreement and review which will serve as a

working document and shall be regularly used by managers and individuals as a reference document on objectives for performance monitoring and the next cycle when reviewing progress. Armstrong (2006) observes that after feedback, the staff benefits from the exercise by specifically knowing the where and how of improvement, and the opportunity to do so at the workplace through coaching. He notes that it is incumbent upon the employee to have the will to improve for the process of learning to follow. In addition to the employee benefiting from coaching and the experience of work, there can be an opportunity for formal specific training to meet a capacity need. When the improvement plan has been sufficiently made, then the cycle of goal setting, appraisal, feedback, reward, and improvement plan is repeated and again.

### **Performance Management and the Church**

Although some scholars find performance management foreign and incompatible with the divine calling (Lin, 2017; Yahanpath et al, 2018), Roberts (2015) disagrees with that opinion and asserts that clearly, the concept of accountability is central to the Christian worldview. For instance, he argues that one day we all must stand before the Lord and give an account of how we lived our lives. He avers that this is a truly comprehensive, holistic performance appraisal of both our natural and spiritual job descriptions. Roberts advises that there should be transparency and involvement of the affected in the decision-making process for an ethically accurate rating. Mathenge and Maina (2015) also maintain Robert's view and state that, whereas the church is not a profit-making organization, it has a stewardship responsibility to ensure that all its resources are used effectively, especially human resources.

Yahanpath et al.(2018) also observe that in recent decades, churches have come under pressure from members and the community to account for their activities, and this requires churches to report on their operations and performance. In addition to the demands from members of the church and community, activity accountability is compliance requirements from central and local governments which in some way is eroding the privileged position of churches. Anastacio (2016) asserts that the higher focus of faith-based institutions is making disciples for Christ besides other social interventions. Based on that background, therefore, there is a need for an integrated strategic management system for managing, monitoring, controlling, and measuring the extent of implementation of their strategic plans.

While the subject of performance management is important in the church, Lin (2017) and (Yahanpath et al., 2018) caution that it is perilous to directly equate the church and business field and apply management principles used in business without proper contextualizing to the church uniqueness. The argument is that, contrary to the business pursuit, the main focus of the church is being a missionary to the lost world to restore mankind to God (Wulandari, 2019). As a matter of illustration, it is imprudent to call the believers and members of a church, customers in the terminology of the profit-making sector because it runs contrary to more theological perspectives of the baptized as fellow disciples and evangelical witnesses of the church rather than its customers (Lin, 2017). Lin identifies differences between church objectives and those of secular institutions as incongruent, similarly distinguishing the ethical values of the church as not a major concern in the business sector.

According to Owusu (2016), the persons working in the church believe that God who is an all-powerful being observes their actions; thereby, shaping his or her morality. This belief in fearing God and loving human beings plays a role in the personal values of organizational officers as they carry out the secular role of service delivery and the delivery of accountability. In discoursing on accountability, Oosthuizen (2016) maintains that accountability ensures that evaluation and control can be applied more often across the organization and emphasizes that accountability is a one-person thing. He reasons that people must be held accountable individually for their work and efforts within the organization. Therefore, managers who implement evaluative accountability within an organization must make sure that people know and understand what they are accountable for. About the church, he argues that although the church as an organization must strive to make more people take responsibility for its mission, it should also create a culture of accountability where there is clarity about who is doing what and who is being held accountable.

Whereas performance management has been proven to enhance the performance of employees, there are certain disadvantages observed in performance management. For instance, if organizations do not pay employees according to their performance, it demotivates them from exerting more effort to do better. Employees can be highly motivated if they are appropriately rewarded with tangible and non-tangible rewards. Sometimes when performance management is not properly performed it may affect the relationships of the appraiser and appraisee. This may even be worse if the feedback is improperly given in a way that affects the self-esteem of the employees. Feedback needs to be given in a manner that shows respect to the people to whom the feedback is given. This may also cause some employees to leave the organization either physically or psychologically. Furthermore, the process of performance management demands a lot of resources in terms of time money, and human resources.

## **II. Statement Of The Problem**

The clergy in the Pentecostal Assemblies of God (PAG) in Uganda are entrusted with the responsibility of providing effective leadership and administration to their congregations to promote spiritual and structural development. Their duties include; ensuring congregational pastoral care, acquiring land and constructing places of worship, and organizing meaningful worship to foster spiritual growth. According to the job description outlined in the PAG Constitution, these responsibilities are critical for the growth and sustainability of the fellowship.

However, there are discrepancies between the expectations of the organization and the practical performance of the clergy. The Pastorate Annual Report of 2018 highlighted significant shortcomings in fundamental ministries such as discipleship, baptism, child dedication, counseling, and visitations, which are not being conducted as frequently as required. The Annual Leaders' Summit of 2019 reported a decline in church planting, poor record-keeping, and a decrease in offerings and tithes. The Council of Bishops' minutes from 2020 further indicated a high rate of backsliding among believers and pastors, with some local churches on the verge of closure. The PAG has also failed to meet its strategic goal set in 2006 of planting 13,000 local churches by 2020, achieving only 36 percent of the target with 5,000 congregations.

The leadership ineffectiveness of many clergy has led to negative consequences, including a decline in church attendance, reduced financial income, and fewer new mission frontiers and church plants. Studies have shown that clergy performance significantly impacts membership retention (Dobrotka, 2018; Fowler et al., 2020; Mwenje, 2016; Nyakundi & Ayako, 2020). Transformational leadership has been suggested as a potential solution to improve clergy effectiveness (Allen, 2017; Gregory, 2019; McCall, 2018; Whitehead, 2019). While there is research linking transformational leadership to employee performance in the business context (Safdar & Liu, 2018; Susilo, 2018; Top et al., 2020), there is a lack of empirical studies focusing on its impact on clergy effectiveness in the church context, especially in Africa and Uganda in particular. This study aimed to fill this gap by investigating the role of transformational leadership and performance management on clergy effectiveness in PAG Uganda, addressing both contextual and methodological gaps identified in previous research.

## **III. Literature Review**

The moderating variable in this study was performance management. The rationale for choosing this variable is that performance management is a handmaid of the strategic plan of an organization. Performance management brings together organizational strategy and human resources in a practical manner to achieve organizational vision. Through an effective performance management system, an organization can align the right people with the requisite skills to appropriate positions in a strategic manner for the achievement of organizational goals. More importantly, a performance management system assesses the performance of every individual staff or team to check whether they are moving towards the goals.

A proper performance management system should be established upon policy agreements that define the roles, expectations, and competencies required for effective performance (Armstrong, 2006a). It is enhanced by agreeing upon the objectives and methods of measuring the performance and assessing the level of competencies reached (Armstrong, 2006a). While implementing performance management, a leader should ensure that the performance dimensions are clearly defined, the performance standards are disseminated and transparency is maintained throughout to minimize the subjectivity in appraisal (Gil & Carter, 2016). This should be anchored on transparent and timely communication about performance expectations and providing continuous feedback with a positive attitude as an integral part of communication.

Various studies have been conducted to examine the impact of performance management in improving employee and organizational performance. For instance, Awan et al. (2020) conducted a study on the effectiveness of a performance management system for employee performance through engagement in various branches of private banks located across Pakistan. Performance management system effectiveness (PMSE) is the measure of alignment between employee and organizational objectives. An effective PMS implementation process necessitates that employees eagerly accept and effectively participate in the goal-setting process. The study found out a significant impact of PMSE and work engagement on the task and contextual performance of employees. This study was conducted in Pakistan giving it a contextual gap since this study was conducted in Uganda.

Another study was conducted by Said et al. (2021) on the impact of performance management systems on employees' performance. The study targeted all employees working in Air Blue Pakistan and a sample population of 160 employees participated in the study. The results of the study found that there was a significant effect of a performance management system on employee performance and there was a positive and significant relationship between performance management and employee performance. This study too was conducted in Pakistan, therefore leaving a contextual gap.

In Australia, a study was conducted by Pessl (2016) to examine the performance management process and the influences of its perceived accuracy and fairness on employees' engagement in Australian consulting companies. The purpose of the study was to expand the theoretical aspects of the performance management



process, define the determining factors of the process's effectiveness and efficiency, and examine their influence on employee engagement. The study confirmed the importance of accuracy and fairness as influencing employee engagement, with a particular focus on performance evaluation accuracy, performance consequences accuracy, procedural fairness, and informational fairness. The context of the previous study is different from the current study because it was conducted in Australia by a consulting company while this study was conducted in Uganda targeting the clergy in the PAG church.

A study to examine how performance management systems affect the well-being and performance of academic employees in higher education institutions was carried out by Bauwens (2019). The purpose of the study was to examine how perceptions of performance management fairness affect burnout and organizational citizenship behaviors among academic employees from a university in Flanders Belgium. The research reported that academic employees experience less burnout when performance management fairness is perceived as high. Secondly, the research results showed that performance management distributive and interactional fairness increase organizational citizenship behaviors by reducing burnout and supporting partial mediation. Based on those findings, therefore, the study recommends that higher education institutions should carefully design and implement performance management systems with fair outcomes and treatment of employees. This study was conducted in Belgium among the academic staff of a university while the current study was conducted in Uganda among the clergy in the PAG church.

In Kenya, a study was conducted by Gitonga and Nzulwa (2019) to establish the effect of performance management strategies on service delivery at the Kenya School of Government. The study's findings revealed that total quality management, business process reengineering, kaizen management practices, and balanced scorecard elements of performance management were applied at the Kenya School of Government at different levels, and they all had an influence on the performance of workers. The study further established that the balanced score card was the most important in influencing service delivery followed by kaizen management practices, then business process reengineering, and then total quality management. This study is different from the current study in that it was conducted in Kenya to investigate the service delivery in a government organization. However, the present study was conducted in Uganda among the clergy in the PAG church.

Still in Kenya, another study was conducted by Mulwa and Weru (2017) to explore the influence of performance management systems on employee performance in banks in Kitui Town, Kenya. The research reported that a performance management system enhances employee performance through the provision of reliable performance measures, increasing staff competency and hence the realization of set targets. The study concluded that enacting a performance management system enhances employee performance by setting individual objectives derived from overall organizational goals and identifying skills gaps addressed through training, thus increasing staff competence levels.

In another related research in Kenya by Evans et al (2016) to assess the effects of the performance management process on employee productivity in commercial banks in Turkana County, it was established that the elements of the performance appraisal system, training and development, and reward system of performance management affect employee productivity. This study too leaves a contextual gap since the study was conducted in Kenya targeting the employees of a commercial bank, while the current study was conducted among the clergy in the PAG church in Uganda.

Niyivuga et al. (2019) observed the vitality of appraisal feedback on the performance of supervisors in higher education in Rwanda in the area of cognitive, affective, motivational, and behavioral outcomes and suggested that performance appraisal results be used in determining appropriate rewards and also be used to identify the development needs of the employees. This study is different from the current study because it was conducted in Rwanda among the supervisors in higher education while the current study was conducted among the clergy of the PAG church in Uganda. This study underscored the vitality of using appraisal feedback in performance management to improve staff performance and build their capacity. About the clergy, appraisal will be important in motivating clergy and building their capacity to perform better.

#### **IV. Theoretical Literature**

This study is based on Path-Goal Theory. This theory was originated by House and Mitchell (1975). According to this theory, leaders are effective because of their impact on subordinates' motivation, ability to perform effectively, and satisfaction. The theory is called path-goal because its major concern is how the leader influences the subordinates' perceptions of their work goals, personal goals, and paths to goal attainment, and suggests that a leader's behavior is motivating or satisfying to the degree that the behavior increases subordinate goal attainment and clarifies the paths to these goals. Simply described, the Path-Goal Theory is about how leaders motivate followers to accomplish designated goals (Northouse, 2016). The Path-Goal Theory is an offspring of the Motivational Theory, especially the Expectancy Theory and is closely linked to Situational Leadership Theory in which a leader's behavior of initiating structure and consideration are major determinants of the performance of employees.

This theory holds that the primary focus of a leader is to enhance followers' goal attainment by providing information or rewards in the work environment and providing followers with the elements they think followers need to reach their goals (Northouse, 2016). The fulcrum of the Path-Goal Theory hinges on the motivational functions of the leader which consist of increasing personal pay-offs to subordinates for work-goal attainment and making the path to these pay-offs easier to travel by clarifying it, reducing roadblocks and pitfalls, and increasing the opportunities for personal satisfaction (House, 1971; Olowoselu et al., 2019). A leader has to balance between clarifying ambiguous tasks and showing concern for the psycho-social needs of his subordinates.

The Path-Goal Theory attempts to increase the motivation and happiness of the followers by adding value to follower needs, making the goal clear to all followers, and providing rewards (Northouse, 2016). The Path-Goal Theory focuses on leadership behavior, which is seen as a source of influence that can change the attitude, motivation, and behavior of subordinates (Olowoselu et al., 2019). The Path-Goal Theory can be summarized as a leadership style that explains how leaders can help followers along the path to their goals by selecting specific behaviors that are best suited to followers' needs and to the situation in which followers are working. By choosing the appropriate style, leaders increase followers' expectations for success and satisfaction (Northouse, 2016).

This theory has four components ; directive, supportive, participative and achievement-oriented (Basrie & Jatmikof, 2021; Northouse, 2016). In directive leadership, the leader informs the subordinates what is expected of them, provides specific guidelines, asks the subordinates to follow the rules and procedures, manages the time, and coordinates their work. In the supportive style, the leader gives attention to the needs of subordinates, showing concern for their well-being, and creating a friendly atmosphere in their work environment. The participative component of leadership enables the leader to consult with subordinates and consider their opinions and suggestions. The fourth component of achievement-oriented enables a leader to set challenging objectives, seek performance improvement, emphasize performance excellence, and demonstrate the belief that subordinates will achieve high standards of work.

Whereas there are several strengths of the Path-Goal Theory, it has suffered multiple criticisms. It is said that the Path-Goal Theory is so complex and incorporates so many different aspects of leadership that interpreting the theory can be confusing (Northouse, 2016). It is a difficult task to identify which situation requires which leadership style and incorporate all of the appropriate factors simultaneously into one's selection of a preferred leadership style. How it has to be implemented makes the scope of the Path-Goal Theory so broad and encompasses so many different interrelated sets of assumptions. This therefore makes the theory difficult to use fully in trying to improve the leadership process in a given organizational context.

The second criticism against the Path-Goal Theory is that it has not had adequate empirical studies. Northouse (2016) avers that the claims of the Path-Goal Theory remain tentative because the research findings to date do not provide a full and consistent picture of the basic assumptions and corollaries of the theory. Further criticism against the theory is that it places a great deal of responsibility on leaders and much less on the followers. Since the leader must provide coaching, guidance, and direction for followers, to help the followers define and clarify goals, and help them around obstacles as they attempt to reach their goals, the Path-Goal Theory therefore places much responsibility on the leader. Over time, this kind of leadership could be counterproductive because it promotes dependency and fails to recognize the full abilities of followers.

The Path-Goal Theory has been used by some scholars to explain how it impacts organizational learning. For instance, Farhan (2018) used the theory to propose a learning leadership model. He reasoned that the practical side of the theory is suitable for improving organizational learning. He based the study on the assumption that leaders need to develop their competencies, and the competencies of subordinates by creating a continuous learning process through sharing, exchanging, and improving knowledge and experiences. He opined that learning leaders act as facilitators of the organizational learning process and they adopt the right attitude to motivate the subordinates to learn by removing obstacles and creating a learning culture.

The Path-Goal Theory was also applied by Bickle (2017) to develop the leadership roles of software training consultants. The reasoning was that although considered experts in software implementation, software training consultants are often in leadership roles but have little to no leadership training. The researcher chose to use the dialogic-networked development techniques to develop five key leadership capacities in remote-training consultant teams utilizing the Path-Goal Theory of leadership. The leadership capacities include; customer service, creativity and innovation, listening and communication, coaching and mentoring, and conflict management.

In this study, the theory clarifies objective five and explains most of the objectives in the study. This theory was used to explain the variable of clergy effectiveness in which the behavior of senior leaders in PAG impacts the effectiveness of the subordinates by clarifying goals and tasks but also nurturing relationships with the followers. The theory specifies leader behaviors that enhance subordinate satisfaction and effectiveness of both work unit and subordinate by addressing the effects of leaders' behaviors on the motivation and abilities of immediate subordinate and work unit performance (Malik, 2012) . The theory also helps to understand that when

the clergy's expectations are adequately met and if senior leaders clarify task goals while maintaining good relationships, the clergy will perform effectively, and they shall be highly motivated and satisfied with their job. The contingency learning of the Path-Goal Theory equips a leader to note that different circumstances and different persons may require different approaches in managing their performance. In this case, leaders in PAG should lead contextually discerning how each clergy should be handled situationally.

**V. Research Methodology**

A research methodology is a research strategy that shows how the research was conducted and shows the principles, procedures, and practices that governed it (Igwenagu, 2016). This study was underpinned by the pragmatic philosophy because it uses diverse approaches to be used in studying a phenomenon. This approach enables a researcher to use pluralistic approach to derive knowledge about the problem. According to Johnson and Christensen (2014) pragmatism is about what is ultimately important and justified or valid. This study employed a mixed methods approach to data analysis. Qualitative responses was analyzed using NVivo software, facilitating the organization and coding of qualitative data to identify patterns and themes. Quantitative data was analyzed with the aid of Stata Version 18, utilizing both descriptive and inferential statistical techniques to examine the relationships between variables and draw meaningful conclusions. This comprehensive analytical strategy ensured a better understanding of the data, enhancing the overall validity and reliability of the study's findings.

The target population in the study was the clergy in PAG in Uganda, totaling 5027 members. These included the Bishops, Assembly Pastors, and Associate Pastors. The bishops oversaw the pastorates and were answerable to the Presiding Bishop. Assembly Pastors reported to the bishops and oversaw the assemblies, which were composed of local congregations led by Associate Pastors. PAG has 24 Bishops at the Pastorates, three Bishops at the National Secretariat, 500 Assembly Pastors, and 4500 Associate Pastors. The Assembly Pastors also oversaw 500 Assemblies. Assembly Pastors were assisted by Associate Pastors, with their number determined by the size of the Assembly. Currently, there are 4500 local congregations, the same number as Associate Pastors.

**Table 1**  
*Study Population by Category*

Category	Number
National Executive Committee (Bishops)	3
Pastorate Bishops	24
Assembly Pastors	500
Associate Pastors	4500
Total	5027

A sample population is the respondents selected from the total target population as a representation of the total population. The sample population should be as representative as possible to produce a miniature cross-section (Kothari, 2004). In this study, the sample size was sampled through a cluster multistage random procedure because the study involved different groups at different levels of leadership scattered in different geographical regions in the country (Rahi, 2017). It is suggested by Creswell (2009) that cluster sampling is appropriate if it is impossible or impractical to compile a list of the elements composing the population.

Using Yamane's formula (Yamane, 1973 as used in Uakarn et al., 2021; Wulandari & Kurniasih, 2019), the sample size for the study consisted of 310 participants. Below is the Yamane formula and how the sample size was been obtained.

$$n = \frac{N}{1 + N \times e^2}$$

Where n= Sample Size

N = Population Size

E = Level of precision (0.055)

$$N = \frac{5027}{1 + 5027 \times (0.054923)^2}$$

n = 311 clergy

The distribution of participants shall be as below:

Bishops,  $\frac{27 \times 310}{5027} = 1.7 \approx 2$

Assembly Pastors,  $\frac{500 \times 310}{5027} = 31$

Associate Pastors,  $\frac{4500 \times 310}{5027} = 278$

The study included 1 Bishop from NEC, 1 pastorate Bishop, 31 Assembly Pastors, and 278 Associate Pastors, totaling 311 clergy.

**Table 2**  
***Proportionate Distribution of Assembly and Associate Pastors***

Pastorate	Regions		Assembly Pastors	Associate Pastors	Sampled number of Pastors	
	Eastern	Northern			Assembly Pastors	Associate Pastors
North Bukedi	Eastern		35	092	3	10
Busoga	Eastern		19	102	2	12
West Teso	Eastern		18	171	1	20
Sebei	Eastern		09	024	1	3
North Teso	Eastern		22	185	2	21
South Teso	Eastern		34	310	3	35
South Bugisu	Eastern		24	046	2	5
Central Teso	Eastern		41	322	3	37
South Bukedi	Eastern		06	050	0	6
<b>Sub Total for Eastern</b>			208	1,302	17	149
West Lango		Northern	73	559	6	64
East Acholi		Northern	48	166	4	19
East Lango		Northern	25	210	2	24
West Acholi		Northern	24	200	2	23
<b>Sub Total for Northern</b>			170	1,135	14	130
<b>Grand Total for the Two regions</b>			378	2,437	31	278

As seen in Table 3, the population distribution in the study included a total of 208 Assembly Pastors and 1,302 Associate Pastors from the Eastern region, and 170 Assembly Pastors and 1,135 Associate Pastors from the Northern region. In the sample distribution, the Eastern region had 17 Assembly Pastors and 149 Associate Pastors, while the Northern region had 14 Assembly Pastors and 130 Associate Pastors. Additionally, there were 2 Bishops included in the sample, one from the National Executive Committee and one pastorate Bishop bringing the total number of respondents to 311, as was earlier reported in the sample size calculation.

Given the mixed-methods study, both open-ended and closed-ended questionnaires were used to gain both qualitative and quantitative insights from the participants. The open-ended questions yielded textual data, which were analyzed thematically. The closed-ended questionnaires yielded numeric data, which were analyzed statistically with the aid of Stata software Version 18 (Tashakkori & Creswell, 2007).

The data collected were both quantitative and qualitative. Quantitative data were derived from closed-ended responses, while qualitative data were derived from open-ended responses (Creswell, 2009). The closed-ended questions came first, and the open-ended questions followed. To integrate the numerical and textual data, the researcher followed concurrent approaches to data collection (Rai, 2020). The data were gathered using closed-ended and open-ended questionnaires. The concurrent strategy was preferred because it validated one form of data with the other and transformed the data for comparison and inference.

Quantitative data were analyzed using Stata software Version 18. Descriptive statistics, such as frequency tables, pie charts, and bar charts, were used to summarize the respondents' basic profile and provide a description of the background characteristics of the participants. These descriptive statistics addressed the objective of understanding the demographic distribution of the sample. Inferential statistics, including Pearson correlations and hierarchical linear regression analysis, were employed to predict the relationships between given values of multiple variables, specifically to identify factors enhancing or shrinking clergy effectiveness. These inferential analyses addressed the objective of understanding the relationships and potential predictors within the data (Ali & Bhaskar, 2016).

Qualitative data were analyzed using the thematic strategy with the help of NVivo software version 14. Thematic analysis was used to identify, analyze, and report patterns (themes) within the data. This qualitative analysis addressed the objective of exploring the in-depth perspectives and experiences of the participants. Figures and visual representations of the themes show the results of the thematic analysis (Creswell, 2009; Creswell, 2013).

## **VI. Moderating Effects Of Performance Management On The Relationship Between Transformational Leadership And Clergy Effectiveness In PAG In Uganda**

The fifth objective of the study was to establish the moderating effects of performance management on the relationship between transformational leadership and clergy effectiveness in PAG in Uganda. This was also

stated in the null hypothesis as Performance management has no significant positive moderating effects on the relationship between transformational leadership and clergy effectiveness in PAG in Uganda.

The Hierarchical Linear Regression Model was employed to test for the moderating impact of performance management factors on the relationship between transformational leadership and clergy effectiveness. The results are presented in Table 10 as seen below.

**Table 11**  
**Hierarchical Linear Regression Model for Testing Moderating Effects**

Model 1:						
				Number of obs	=	236
Source	SS	Df	MS	F(4, 231)	=	22.01
Model	1698.39542	4	424.598855	Prob > F	=	0.0000
Residual	4456.28255	231	19.2912664	R-squared	=	0.2760
Total	6154.67797	235	26.190119	Adj R-squared	=	0.2634
				Root MSE	=	4.3922
Clergy effectiveness	Coefficient	Std. err.	T	P> t	[95% conf. interval]	
Idealized	-.0804553	.1114221	-0.72	0.471	-.2999888	.1390782
individualized	.2488682	.1064346	2.34	0.020	.0391615	.4585748
Intellectual	.0685237	.0844401	0.81	0.418	-.0978475	.234895
Inspirational	.4061679	.116339	3.49	0.001	.1769467	.6353892
_cons	7.873462	1.627353	4.84	0.000	4.667111	11.07981
Model 2:						
				Number of obs	=	236
Source	SS	Df	MS	F(9, 226)	=	19.83
Model	2716.06072	9	301.784525	Prob > F	=	0.0000
Residual	3438.61725	226	15.2151206	R-squared	=	0.4413
Total	6154.67797	235	26.190119	Adj R-squared	=	0.4191
				Root MSE	=	3.9007
Clergy effectiveness	Coefficient	Std. err.	T	P> t	[95% conf. interval]	
Idealized	-.0202687	.1001077	-0.20	0.840	-.2175326	.1769951
individualized	.1750357	.0964149	1.82	0.071	-.0149514	.3650227
Intellectual	.0310667	.0764491	0.41	0.685	-.1195775	.1817109
Inspirational	.3752188	.1058803	3.54	0.000	.16658	.5838577
Appraisal	-.36564	.0798869	-4.58	0.000	-.5230584	-.2082216
Feedback	.2405412	.065232	3.69	0.000	.1120005	.3690819
Rewarding	-.0599207	.058707	-1.02	0.309	-.1756038	.0557624
improvement plan	.3928635	.0605614	6.49	0.000	.2735263	.5122006
_cons	6.75561	1.517404	4.45	0.000	3.765541	9.745678
R-Square Diff.	Model 2-	Model 1	= 0.165	F(5,226)	= 13.377	p = 0.000
Model 3:						
				Number of obs	=	236
Source	SS	Df	MS	F(11, 220)	=	21.32
Model	3155.84446	11	286.894951	Prob > F	=	0.0000
Residual	2961.0133	220	13.4591514	R-squared	=	0.5159
Total	6116.85776	231	26.4799037	Adj R-squared	=	0.4917
				Root MSE	=	3.6687
Clergy effectiveness	Coefficient	Std. err.	T	P> t	[95% conf. interval]	
Idealized	.0319681	.0951345	0.34	0.737	-.1555236	.2194598
individualized	.2153494	.0921837	2.34	0.020	.0336732	.3970255
Intellectual	.0351372	.0723078	0.49	0.627	-.1073674	.1776418
Inspirational	.279142	.1022922	2.73	0.007	.077544	.48074
Goalsetting	-.0330007	.0586022	-0.56	0.574	-.1484942	.0824928
Appraisal	-.3330774	.0763937	-4.36	0.000	-.4836344	-.1825203
Feedback	.1774405	.0632097	2.81	0.005	.0528665	.3020145
Rewarding	-.0907887	.0583063	-1.56	0.121	-.2056992	.0241218
improvement plan	.4233056	.0578281	7.32	0.000	.3093376	.5372737
Age(71+)	-16.41823	3.885905	-4.23	0.000	-.24.0766	-8.759868
Education (PLE certificate)	-2.092549	.6590215	-3.18	0.002	-3.391352	-.7937458
_cons	7.040965	1.446958	4.87	0.000	4.189293	9.892637
R-Square Diff.	Model 2-	Model 1	= 0.075	F(2,220)	= 16.338	p = 0.000

Model	R2	F(df)	P	R2 change	F(df) change	p
1:	0.276	22.010(4,231)	0.000			
2:	0.441	19.835(9,226)	0.000	0.165	13.377(5,226)	0.000
3:	0.516	21.316(11,220)	0.000	0.075	16.338(2,220)	0.000

Source: Author (2024)

Model 1 examined the direct effects of transformational leadership factors (idealized influence, individualized consideration, intellectual stimulation, and inspirational motivation) on clergy effectiveness. The model accounts for 27.6% of the variance in clergy effectiveness (R-squared = 0.2760), with a significant overall model fit ( $F(4, 231) = 22.01, p = 0.000$ ). Among the transformational leadership factors, individualized consideration ( $b = 0.2489, p = 0.020$ ) and inspirational motivation ( $b = 0.4062, p = 0.001$ ) significantly predicted clergy effectiveness. Idealized influence and intellectual stimulation did not have significant effects. Therefore, as individualized consideration rises, clergy effectiveness also rises. This can be seen through more frequent communications and meetings, personal support and visits, and active listening and empathy towards congregants. Inspirational motivation increases clergy effectiveness by providing a clear vision, fostering enthusiasm, and emotionally engaging the congregation.

Model 2 included the moderating factors (goal setting, appraisal, feedback, rewarding, and improvement plan) in addition to the transformational leadership factors. The model explains 44.13% of the variance in clergy effectiveness (R-squared = 0.4413), with a significant overall fit ( $F(9, 226) = 19.83, p = 0.000$ ). This model shows a substantial improvement over Model 1, as indicated by the R-squared change of 0.165 ( $F(5, 226) = 13.377, p = 0.000$ ). Significant predictors include inspirational motivation ( $b = 0.3752, p = 0.000$ ), appraisal ( $b = -0.3656, p = 0.000$ ), feedback ( $b = 0.2405, p = 0.000$ ), and improvement plan ( $b = 0.3929, p = 0.000$ ). Individualized consideration is marginally significant ( $b = 0.1750, p = 0.071$ ). Thus, incorporating moderating factors enhances the understanding of clergy effectiveness. Inspirational motivation continues to be a significant predictor, reinforcing the importance of vision and enthusiasm. Appraisal negatively affects clergy effectiveness, possibly due to stress or negative feedback. Positive feedback and improvement plans enhance clergy effectiveness by providing constructive guidance and a clear path for development. Individualized consideration, while marginally significant, still suggests that personal attention to congregants improves effectiveness.

Model 3 incorporates background characteristics (age and education) along with transformational leadership factors and moderating factors. The model explains 51.59% of the variance in clergy effectiveness (R-squared = 0.5159), with a significant overall fit ( $F(11, 220) = 21.32, p = 0.000$ ). This model shows an additional improvement over Model 2, with an R-squared change of 0.075 ( $F(2, 220) = 16.338, p = 0.000$ ). Significant predictors in this model include individualized consideration ( $b = 0.2153, p = 0.020$ ), inspirational motivation ( $b = 0.2791, p = 0.007$ ), appraisal ( $b = -0.3331, p = 0.000$ ), feedback ( $b = 0.1774, p = 0.005$ ), improvement plan ( $b = 0.4233, p = 0.000$ ), and age ( $b = -16.4182, p = 0.000$ ). The effects of goal setting and rewarding are not significant. Consequently, adding background characteristics further refines the model. Age negatively impacts clergy effectiveness, indicating that older clergy members may face more challenges. Individualized consideration remains significant, suggesting that personal interactions and support enhance effectiveness. Inspirational motivation continues to be crucial, reinforcing the role of vision and motivation. Appraisal remains negatively associated, while positive feedback and improvement plans continue to positively influence clergy effectiveness.

## VII. Discussion Of Findings

The hypothesis that performance management had no significant positive moderating effects on the relationship between transformational leadership and clergy effectiveness in PAG in Uganda was rejected. The inclusion of performance management factors in Model 2 significantly improved the model's explanatory power (R-squared change of 0.165,  $F(5, 226) = 13.377, p = 0.000$ ). Significant predictors such as appraisal ( $b = -0.3656, p = 0.000$ ), feedback ( $b = 0.2405, p = 0.000$ ), and improvement plan ( $b = 0.3929, p = 0.000$ ) indicated that these performance management practices enhanced the impact of transformational leadership on clergy effectiveness.

The study findings demonstrated that performance management factors significantly moderated the relationship between transformational leadership and clergy effectiveness. Appraisal ( $b = -0.3656, p = 0.000$ ) had a negative coefficient, indicating that more frequent or rigorous appraisals might be associated with lower perceived clergy effectiveness, potentially due to stress or negative feedback from the appraisal process. Feedback ( $b = 0.2405, p = 0.000$ ) had a significant positive coefficient, suggesting that providing constructive feedback enhanced clergy effectiveness. This indicated that feedback processes that focused on positive reinforcement and developmental guidance could improve performance. Improvement plans ( $b = 0.3929, p = 0.000$ ) had a strong positive coefficient, indicating that structured plans for improvement significantly enhanced clergy effectiveness. This suggested that clear and actionable improvement strategies contributed positively to clergy performance. The inclusion of background characteristics (age and education) in Model 3 provided additional insights. Age ( $b$

= -16.4182,  $p = 0.000$ ) had a significant negative coefficient, indicating that older clergy members might face more challenges in maintaining high levels of effectiveness. This could be due to generational differences in leadership styles, adaptability to modern practices, or other age-related factors. Although not explicitly mentioned in the coefficients, education as a background characteristic was included to refine the model further. The implication is that varying levels of education might interact with transformational leadership and performance management practices, influencing overall effectiveness.

### **VIII. Conclusions Of The Study**

The study demonstrated, based on the Hierarchical Linear Regression Model, that performance management factors such as feedback, improvement plans, and appraisal are prudent in moderating the relationship between transformational leadership and clergy effectiveness. Transformational leadership factors such as individualized consideration and inspirational motivation were found to directly improve clergy performance. Leaders who provided personalized attention, frequent communication, and emotional engagement with their congregants were more effective. Model 1 revealed that transformational leadership factors predicted only 27.6% of the variation in clergy effectiveness.

However, when these models were moderated with a block of performance management factors specifically goal setting, appraisal, feedback, rewarding, and improvement plans the coefficient of determination grew to 44.1% of the changes in clergy effectiveness. This further blossomed to 51.6% with the inclusion of demographic factors, particularly age and the highest level of education of the clergy members. The findings demonstrated that performance management factors are essential in enhancing the relationship between transformational leadership and clergy effectiveness. Positive feedback and structured improvement plans provided constructive guidance and fostered development, while appraisal had a negative impact, likely due to the stress associated with performance evaluations. Additionally, the analysis highlighted that older clergy members faced more challenges, indicating the need for tailored support for this group.

### **IX. Recommendations**

The study recommends maximizing clergy effectiveness by integrating performance management factors such as positive feedback, improvement plans, and constructive appraisal systems. These factors should be tailored to provide constructive guidance and foster development, while mitigating stress. Additionally, the study opines that offering extra support to older clergy members and considering their unique challenges is crucial. Incorporating these performance management strategies will enhance the impact of transformational leadership on clergy effectiveness.

### **References**

- [1] Aguinis, H. (2013). *Performance Management* (3rd Ed.). Pearson.
- [2] Aguinis, H. (2019). *Performance Management: A Continuous Process Of Identifying, Measuring, And Developing The Performance Of Individuals And Teams*. Pearson.
- [3] Al-Husseini, S., & Elbeltagi, I. (2018). Evaluating The Effect Of Transformational Leadership On Knowledge Sharing Using Structural Equation Modelling: The Case Of Iraqi Higher Education. *International Journal Of Leadership In Education*, 21(4), 506–517. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13603124.2016.1142119>
- [4] Al-Khamaiseh, Z., Halim, B. B. A., Afthanorhan, A., Alqahtani, A. H., & Alkhlaifat, B. I. (2019). Exploring And Developing Items Measuring Goal Setting In The Context Of Jordan Telecommunication Sector. *International Journal Of Academic Research In Business And Social Sciences*, 9(12), 831–847.
- [5] Ali, Z., & Bhaskar, S. B. (2016). Basic Statistical Tools In Research And Data Analysis. *Indian Journal Of Anaesthesia*, 60(9), 662–669.
- [6] Andriani, S., Kesumawati, N., & Kristiawan, M. (2018). The Influence Of Transformational Leadership And Work Motivation On Teachers' Performance. *International Journal Of Scientific And Technology Research*, 7(7), 19–29.
- [7] Armstrong, M. (2006). *A Handbook Of Human Resource Management Practice* (10th Ed.). Kogan.
- [8] Armstrong, M., & Taylor, S. (2014). *Armstrong's Handbook Of Human Resource Management Practice* (13th Ed.). Kogan.
- [9] Asbari, M., Santoso, P. B., & Prasetya, A. B. (2020). Elitical And Antidemocratic Transformational Leadership Critics: Is It Still Relevant? *International Journal Of Social, Policy And Law*, 1(1), 11–16.
- [10] Audenaert, M., Decramer, A., & George, B. (2021). How To Foster Employee Quality Of Life: The Role Of Employee Performance Management And Authentic Leadership. *Evaluation And Program Planning*, 85, 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.evalprogplan.2021.101906>
- [11] Audenaert, M., Decramer, A., George, B., Verschuere, B., & Van Waeyenberg, T. (2016). When Employee Performance Management Affects Individual Innovation In Public Organizations: The Role Of Consistency And LMX. *International Journal Of Human Resource Management*, 30(5), 815–834.
- [12] Awan, S. H., Habib, N., Shoaib Akhtar, C., & Naveed, S. (2020). Effectiveness Of Performance Management System For Employee Performance Through Engagement. *SAGE Open*, 10(4). <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244020969382>
- [13] Basrie, H., & Jatmikof, B. (2021). Leadership Comparison Model At Higher University: Contingency Friendler Method, Path-Goal Theory Method, And Harsey And Blanchard Method. *Leadership*.
- [14] Bauwens, R. (2019). *Performance Management Implementation In Higher Education: Leaders, Success Conditions, And Implications For Well-Being And Performance*. Ghent University.
- [15] Bickle, J. T. (2017). Developing Remote Training Consultants As Leaders-Dialogic/Network Application Of Path-Goal Leadership Theory In Leadership Development. *Performance Improvement*, 56(9), 32–39. <https://doi.org/10.1002/Pfi.21737>

- [16] Bin Atan, J., & Mahmood, N. H. N. (2019). The Role Of Transformational Leadership Style In Enhancing Employees' Competency For Organization Performance. *Management Science Letters*, 9(13), 2191–2200.
- [17] Bonsu, S. (2018). Leadership Style In The Global Economy: A Focus On Cross-Cultural And Transformational Leadership. *Journal Of Marketing And Management*, 9(2), 1–23.
- [18] Cappelli, P., & Conyon, M. J. (2018). What Do Performance Appraisals Do? *ILR Review*, 71(1), 88–116. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0019793917698649>
- [19] Chawla, N., Gabriel, A. S., Dahling, J. J., & Patel, K. (2016). Feedback Dynamics Are Critical To Improving Performance Management Systems. *Industrial And Organizational Psychology*, 9(2), 253–377. <https://doi.org/10.1017/Iop.2016.22>
- [20] Chen, R., Lee, Y. D., & Wang, C. H. (2020). Total Quality Management And Sustainable Competitive Advantage: Serial Mediation Of Transformational Leadership And Executive Ability. *Total Quality Management And Business Excellence*, 31(5–6), 451–468. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14783363.2018.1486561>
- [21] Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, And Mixed Methods Approaches*. Sage.
- [22] Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative Inquiry And Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches* (3rd Ed.). SAGE.
- [23] Evans, K. K., Geoffrey, K. K., & Chege, K. (2016). Effects Of Performance Management Process On Employee Productivity: A Survey Of Commercial Banks In Turkana County. *Journal Of Business And Management*, 18(11), 52–64.
- [24] Farhan, B. Y. (2018). Application Of Path-Goal Leadership Theory And Learning Theory In A Learning Organization. *Journal Of Applied Business Research*, 34(1), 13–22.
- [25] Franco-Santos, M., & Otley, D. (2018). Reviewing And Theorizing The Unintended Consequences Of Performance Management Systems. *International Journal Of Management Reviews*, 20(3), 696–730.
- [26] Ghasabeh, M. S., & Provitera, M. J. (2017). Transformational Leadership: Building An Effective Culture To Manage Organisational Knowledge. *The Journal Of Values-Based Leadership*, 10(2), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.22543/0733.102.1185>
- [27] Giddens, J. (2018). Transformational Leadership: What Every Nursing Dean Should Know. *Journal Of Professional Nursing*, 34(2), 117–121. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.profnurs.2017.10.004>
- [28] Gil, P. J. J., & Carter, S. L. (2016). Graphic Feedback, Performance Feedback, And Goal Setting Increased Staff Compliance With A Data Collection Task At A Large Residential Facility. *Journal Of Organizational Behavior Management*, 36(1), 56–70. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01608061.2016.1139607>
- [29] Gitonga, L. N., & Nzulwa, J. (2019). Effect Of Performance Management Strategies On Service Delivery In Government Institutions: A Case Of Kenya School Of Government. *International Academic Journal Of Human Resource And Business Administration*, 3(5), 255–278.
- [30] Gregory, T. (2019). Transformational Pastoral Leadership. *Journal Of Biblical Perspectives In Leadership*, 13(1), 56–75.
- [31] Helmold, M., & Terry, B. (2021). *Operations And Supply Management 4.0: Industry Insights, Case Studies And Best Practices*. Springer.
- [32] Hentschel, T., Braun, S., Peus, C., & Frey, D. (2018). The Communitary-Bonus Effect For Male Transformational Leaders: Leadership Style, Gender, And Promotability. *European Journal Of Work And Organizational Psychology*, 27(1), 112–125. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1359432X.2017.1402759>
- [33] House, R. J. (1971). A Path-Goal Theory Of Leader Effectiveness. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 16(3), 321–339. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2391905>
- [34] Igwenagu, C. (2016). *Fundamentals Of Research Methodology And Data Collection*. Researchgate.
- [35] Izquierdo, C. C., Samaniego, M. J. G., & Cabezudo, R. S. J. (2015). How Strategic Purchasing Orientation And Transformational Leadership Impact Performance: The Mediating Role Of Information And Communication Technologies. *Journal Of Business-To-Business Marketing*, 22(4), 269–292. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1051712X.2015.1104408>
- [36] Jacob, C. J., Stoler, J., & Roth, G. (2017). A Pilot Study Of Transformational Leadership And College Counseling Outcomes. *Journal Of Creativity In Mental Health*, 12(2), 180–191. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15401383.2016.1238790>
- [37] Jensen, U. T., Andersen, L. B., Bro, L. L., Bøllingtoft, A., Eriksen, T. L. M., Holten, A. L., & Würtz, A. (2016). Conceptualizing And Measuring Transformational And Transactional Leadership. *Administration And Society*, 51(1), 3–33. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0095399716647152>
- [38] Jia, J., Liu, H., Chin, T., & Hu, D. (2018). The Continuous Mediating Effects Of GHRM On Employees' Green Passion Via Transformational Leadership And Green Creativity. *Sustainability*, 10(9). <https://doi.org/10.3390/Su10093237>
- [39] Johnson, R. B., & Christensen, L. (2014). *Educational Research: Quantitative, Qualitative, And Mixed Approaches* (5th Ed.). Sage.
- [40] Kampkötter, P. (2017). Performance Appraisals And Job Satisfaction. *International Journal Of Human Resource Management*, 28(5), 750–774. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585192.2015.1109538>
- [41] Khalil, U., & Sahibzadah, S. (2021). Leaders' Individualized Consideration And Employees' Job Satisfaction. *Journal Of Business & Tourism*, 3(2), 183–191.
- [42] Kim, S., & Shin, M. (2019). Transformational Leadership Behaviors, The Empowering Process, And Organizational Commitment: Investigating The Moderating Role Of Organizational Structure In Korea. *International Journal Of Human Resource Management*, 30(2), 251–275. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585192.2016.1244100>
- [43] Kindarto, A., Zhu, Y., & Gardner, D. G. (2020). Full Range Leadership Styles And Government IT Team Performance: The Critical Roles Of Follower And Team Competence. *Public Performance & Management Review*, 43(4), 889–917. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15309576.2020.1740717>
- [44] Kotamena, F., Senjaya, P., & Prasetya, A. B. (2020). A Literature Review: Is Transformational Leadership Elitist And Antidemocratic? *International Journal Of Sociology, Policy And Law*, 1(1), 35–43.
- [45] Kothari, C. R. (2004). *Research Methodology: Methods And Techniques* (2nd Ed.). New Age International Publishers.
- [46] Lin, C. K. L. (2017). *The Church And Management: Synthesis Of A Reorientation Framework For Management Theories Through A Theological Engagement With Management Science*. Australian Catholic University.
- [47] Malik, H. S. (2012). A Study Relationship Between Leader Behaviors And Subordinate Job Expectancies: A Path-Goal Approach. *Pakistan Journal Of Commerce And Social Sciences*, 6(2), 357–371.
- [48] Mathenge, F., & Maina, P. (2015). Human Resource Management Practices Of The Presbyterian Church Of East Africa And Organization's Performance: The Case Of PCEA St. Andrews, Nairobi Kenya. *Journal Of Marketing And Consumer Research*, 10, 30–59.
- [49] Mollé, E. R., Mulongo, L. S., & Razia, M. (2017). The Influence Of Performance Appraisal Practices On Employee Productivity: A Case Of Muheza District, Tanzania. *Issues In Business Management And Economics*, 5(4), 45–59.
- [50] Moradi, K. M., & Shahbazi, H. (2016). An Analysis Of The Transformational Leadership Theory. *Journal Of Fundamental And Applied Sciences*, 4(1), 452–461. <https://doi.org/10.4314/Jfas.V8i2.14>



- [51] Mulwa, M. N., & Weru, J. M. (2017). The Influence Of Performance Management System On Employee Performance In Commercial Banks In Kitui Town, Kitui County, Kenya. *International Journal Of Humanities And Social Science*, 7(6), 44–55.
- [52] Murphy, K. R. (2020). Performance Evaluation Will Not Die, But It Should. *Human Resource Management Journal*, 30(1), 13–31. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1748-8583.12259>
- [53] Nduati, M. M., & Wanyoike, R. (2022). Employee Performance Management Practices And Organizational Effectiveness. *International Academic Journal Of Human Resource And Business Administration*, 3(10), 361–378.
- [54] Niyivuga, B., Otara, A., & Tuyishime, D. (2019). Monitoring And Evaluation Practices And Academic Staff Motivation: Implications In Higher Education Within Rwandan Context. *SAGE Open*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244019870174>
- [55] Northouse, P. G. (2016). *Leadership: Theory And Practice* (7th Ed.). Sage.
- [56] Okere, O. O., & Olorunfemi, M. (2018). Academic Library Leadership In South West Nigeria And Recession: An Exploratory Study. *International Information & Library Review*, 50(3), 202–211. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10572317.2018.1502379>
- [57] Olowoselu, A., Mohamad, M., Aboudahr, S. M., & Mohamed, F. (2019). Path Goal Theory And The Application In Educational Management And Leadership. *Education Quarterly Reviews*, 2(2), 447–455.
- [58] Oosthuizen, A. J. (2016). *Managing The Household Of God* [Doctoral Dissertation, Central University Of Technology].
- [59] Owusu, C. A. (2016). *Accountability In Ngos: Evidence Of Two Christian Faith-Based Organizations In Ghana* [Doctoral Dissertation, Royal Holloway, University Of London].
- [60] Pessl, S. (2016). The Performance Management Process: Influences Of The Perceived Accuracy And Fairness On Employees' Engagement In Austrian Consulting Companies [Master's Thesis, Linnaeus University].
- [61] Pina, M., Vieira, D. V., & Clegg, S. (2018). Why Does Performance Management Not Perform? *International Journal Of Productivity And Performance Management*, 67(4), 673–692. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJPPM-11-2016-0258>
- [62] Pulakos, E. D., & O'Leary, R. S. (2011). Why Is Performance Management Broken? *Industrial And Organizational Psychology*, 4(2), 146–164. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1754-9434.2011.01315.x>
- [63] Rai, K. B. (2020). Design And Data Integration In Mixed Methods Research: Challenges And Ways Forward. *Research Nepal Journal Of Development Studies*, 1(2), 1–20.
- [64] Rahi, S. (2017). Research Design And Methods: A Systematic Review Of Research Paradigms, Sampling Issues And Instruments Development. *International Journal Of Economics & Management Sciences*, 6(2), 1–5.
- [65] Rao, T. V. (2016). *Performance Management: Toward Organizational Excellence*. SAGE.
- [66] Reza, M. H. (2019). Multidisciplinary. *EPR International Journal Of Multidisciplinary Research*, 5(3), 1–8.
- [67] Roberts, G. E. (2015). *Christian Scripture And Human Resource Management: Building A Path To Servant Leadership Through Faith*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- [68] Safdar, S., & Liu, S. (2018). Effect Of Transformational Leadership On Employee Creativity Through Organizational Commitment. *International Journal Of Managerial Studies And Research*, 6(1), 61–67.
- [69] Said, M., Khan, I., & Hameed, F. (2021). The Impact Of Performance Management System On Employee Performance. *International Journal Of Business And Management Sciences*, 2(3), 38–47.
- [70] Schleicher, D. J., Baumann, H. M., Sullivan, D. W., Levy, P. E., Hargrove, D. C., & Barros-Rivera, B. A. (2018). Putting The System Into Performance Management Systems: A Review And Agenda For Performance Management Research. *Journal Of Management*, 44(6), 2209–2245.
- [71] Steelman, L. A., & Williams, J. R. (2019). *Feedback At Work*. Springer.
- [72] Sulieman, A., & Alqatawenh, A. S. (2018). Transformational Leadership Style And Its Relationship With Change Management. *Verslas: Teorija Ir Praktika / Business: Theory And Practice*, 19, 17–24.
- [73] Susilo, D. (2018). Transformational Leadership: A Style Of Motivating Employees. *Management And Economics Journal*, 3(2), 105–123.
- [74] Suwandana, I. G. M. (2019). Role Of Transformational Leadership Mediation: Effect Of Emotional And Communication Intelligence Towards Teamwork Effectiveness. *International Research Journal Of Management, IT & Social Sciences*, 6(2), 52–62.
- [75] Taouab, O., & Issor, Z. (2019). Firm Performance: Definition And Measurement Models. *European Scientific Journal*, 15(1), 93–106.
- [76] Tashakkori, A., & Creswell, J. W. (2007). The New Era Of Mixed Methods. *Journal Of Mixed Methods Research*, 1(1), 3–7.
- [77] Top, C., Abdullah, B. M. S., & Faraj, A. H. M. (2020). Transformational Leadership Impact On Employees Performance. *Eurasian Journal Of Management & Social Sciences*, 1(1), 49–59.
- [78] Torlak, N. G., & Kuzey, C. (2019). Leadership, Job Satisfaction And Performance Links In Private Education Institutes Of Pakistan. *International Journal Of Productivity And Performance Management*, 68(2), 276–295.
- [79] Uakam, C., Chaokromthong, K., & Sintao, N. (2021). Sample Size Estimation Using Yamane And Cochran And Krejcie And Morgan And Green Formulas And Cohen Statistical Power Analysis By G\*Power And Comparisons. *Apheit International Journal*, 10(2), 76–88.
- [80] Walk, M., & Kennedy, T. (2017). Making Nonprofits More Effective: Performance Management And Performance Appraisals. In *The Nonprofit Human Resource Management Handbook: From Theory To Practice* (Pp. Xx–Xx). Taylor & Francis.
- [81] White, B. A. A., Et Al. (2017). [Citation Details Not Provided In Text].
- [82] Wulandari, C., & Kurniasih, H. (2019). Community Preferences For Social Forestry Facilitation Programming In Lampung, Indonesia. *Forest And Society*, 3(April), 114–132.
- [83] Wulandari, R. (2019). Entrepreneurial Orientation And Church Performance In The Roman Catholic Archdiocese Of Jakarta. *Global Business And Organizational Excellence*, 38(6), 52–60.
- [84] Yahanpath, N., Pacheco, P., & Burns, E. A. (2018). Discussing A Balanced Scorecard For One Local Independent New Zealand Church. *Journal Of Management, Spirituality And Religion*, 15(1), 1–19.
- [85] Yamane, T. (1973). *Statistics: An Introductory Analysis* (3rd Ed.). Harper & Row.
- [86] Yamin, M. A. Y. (2020). Examining The Role Of Transformational Leadership And Entrepreneurial Orientation On Employee Retention With Moderating Role Of Competitive Advantage. *Management Science Letters*, 10(2), 313–326.
- [87] Yukl, G. (2013). *Leadership In Organizations* (8th Ed.). Pearson.