

The Effects of Customers Experience on ATM Refund System for Failed Bank Transactions: A Study of Deposit Money Banks in Maiduguri, Borno State, Nigeria

¹ Mohammed Madawaki, ² Mohammed Alhaji Audu and
³ Alexander Solomon Oghoyone

¹Department of Finance University of Maiduguri P .M. B 1069 Maiduguri, Borno State, Nigeria

²Department of Finance University of Maiduguri P .M. B 1069 Maiduguri, Borno State, Nigeria

^{3C}/o Department of Finance University of Maiduguri P .M. B 1069 Maiduguri, Borno State, Nigeria

Abstract: *This paper examines the advent of technology brought with it relative ease with which the banking industry transact their businesses electronically without direct contact especially as it relate to their numerous customers. One of such intricate technology is the introduction of the ATM. This technology has made customer's access to their cash relatively easy as well safe their time from endless queues. The ATM machine soon gave rise to certain problems such as losses on customers being addressed in this research work. Again, the loss of cash due to failed transactions at ATM across the Metropolis. Some respondents argue that just like any other technology, this one does not work in isolation. There are other factors such as power, internet connectivity and so on needs to function optimally for ATM to deliver efficiently but while the argument goes on, customers are being affected negatively there by leading to apathy and discontent in the use of ATM especially in Maiduguri Metropolis .The research reveals that weak government policy on banks, illiteracy as well as non challant attitudes of customer care services is to blame for the dwindling use of ATM in the state.*

I. Introduction

It is a well known fact that globalization and Information Communication Technology (ICT) took the world by storm and this has posed great challenges to the banking industries [8]. Information and Communication Technology (ICT) has changed not just the business world but also the world we live in. It has changed the way things are done that today no matter what you plan to do whether you will work with people or money, with words or numbers, technology plays an importance role. In fact, it has redefined the world order.

Due to technological breakthrough and advances in telecommunication, speed of equipment and the use of computer, bankers can now use the same links to transmit data. This gave rise to electronic banking which is simply the application of information technology (telecommunication and compute) to transmit data from one point to another. The electronic delivery of banking services has grown rapidly in popularity, that every bank now realizes that electronic banking has become a basic element of today's financial services delivery and one of the known form of electronic banking is the ATM (Automated Teller Machine). The forerunner of all Automated Teller Machine (ATM) began operations at a branch office of Barclays bank in 1967.

The Automated Teller Machines has been adopted and are still being adopted by banks. They offer considerable benefit to both bank and customers. The machine enables the customers to withdraw cash at more convenient times and places than during the banking hours at branches, in addition, by automating services. That work was previously completed manually ATM reduces the cost of servicing some customer's demands – [15]. These potential benefits are multiple when bank share their ATM's allowing customers of other banks to access their account through another bank's ATM [13]banks have become the principle beneficiary of the ATM's these is because of two major reason i.e. to increase their market share. Although due to the prevalence of ATM's, It is not likely to be primarily means by which ATM's increase profitability for most banks above a certain level of operations. The cost of a single transaction performed on an ATM is potentially less than the cost of transaction conducted from a teller and ATMs are capable of handling more transactions per unit of time than are tellers [12].

In Nigeria the deployment of ATM by banks and its use by the bank customers is just gaining ground and has flourish in recent times. These happened especially after the recent consolidation of banks, which has in all probability made it possible for more banks to afford to deploy the machines or at least become part of shared net works^[7].

The incessant increase deployment of the machines in the banking sector has made the issue of technology relatively important. The services of ATM have a history that is less than ten years in Nigeria. At first the machines were operated for privileged minorities services designed for those desirous of exclusive service, cards were rare and the process for obtaining them is extremely complex. Presently the use of ATM cards has been widely promoted. Banks no longer appear to want to have personal contact with their customers and some banks have resorted to penalizing the customers by debiting them for any transaction not on ATM or using ATM cards below threshold stated by their banks processed a cross counters. ^[1] Reported that although only a bank had an ATM in 1998, by 2004 fourteen (14) of them had acquired the technology.

However, Information and Communication Technology in banks has produced positive outcomes such as improved customer services, more accurate record, ensuring convenience in business times prompt and fair attention, faster services etc. ^[6] stated that Nigeria's debit card transaction rose by 93 percent between January 2005 and March 2006 over previous years owing to aggressive roll out initiative by Nigerian Banks powered by inter switch network. The ATMs presently is not only for cash withdrawal rather payment of bills, fund transfers, purchase of air-time for most of the GSM telecommunication's etc. however the banks has not put in place machineries for transaction's that were not successful on the ATM's. Bank customers experience difficulties in refunding ATM failed transactions on the machine. According to ^[14], people have come to feel dehumanized by an impersonal technological business world where they rarely get to interact with a live person, they are extremely frustrated and ready to switch to any one who will treat them better. Customer experience is all about people. Humans have been around for 10,000 year and business is only 200 years in existence only.

More often than not, businesses forget that their customers are emotional beings that desires exceptional experience (exceeding their expectations) to keep them coming back for more service ^[9]. In most countries like India their Apex bank enforced sanctions on ATM failed transactions that were not reversed in time. The reserved bank of India directed banks to reimbursed customers for any amount wrongly debited from their account on failed ATM transaction within seven (7) days of an account holders complaint or else pay a fine of 100RS per day compensation and the RBI already have the time limit of twelve days which has now reduce to seven days.

In Nigeria, ATM was conventionally introduced as an electronic delivery channel in 1989 and was first installed by National Cash Register (NCR) for the defunct Societe Generale Bank of Nigeria in the same year.

Since its introduction, many Nigerian banks have installed ATM in response to the changing nature of modern banking operations. According to ^[18], in Nigeria the deployment of ATM by banks and its use by bank customers is just gaining ground and has burgeoned in recent times. This follows from the number of advantages offered by ATM as a means of servicing the populace.

In separate affirmation, ^[20] similarly posit that banking has undergone several changes and improvement as usually dictated by the dynamic nature of economic the world over, adding that banking and other financial services are becoming more sophisticated to the extent that cash paper work are fast disappearing from banking, rather financial services delivery has moved to Automated Teller Machine, telephone etc. ^[2].

The up surge in the adoption of ATM and other electronic means of delivery banking service can also be partly attributed to the changes in government policies which have heightened the competitive tempo of the Nigeria banking industry. The 2005 bank consolidations programme is an apt paradigm. ^[7] Further maintained that after the consolidation which has all in probability made it possible for more banks to afford to deploy ATMs or at least become part of shared network. In 2010, the apex bank came up with a policy on cash based transactions which stipulates a cash handling charges on daily cash withdrawal or cash deposit that exceed ₦150,000 for individuals and ₦1,000,000 for corporate bodies. The policy on cash based transaction (withdrawal and deposits) in banks, aims at reducing (Not eliminating) the amount of physical cash (coins and notes) circulating in the economy, and encouraging more electronic base transaction e.g. ATM, Point of Sale (POS) etc for payments for goods, services, transfers etc. (CBN 2010). The policy therefore enforces all the banks to orient their customers to use the alternant channels for all their transaction above threshold.

The policies above necessitate the use of ATM, however the problems facing ATM in Nigeria is the normal challenges facing other businesses in Nigeria, like power outages telecoms breakdown and others do affect electronic payment platforms like ATM services. Most of the ATM's run on generator, UPS (uninterrupted power supply), and inverters to back up the PHCN. There are also staff training issues that need to be sorted out and training and re-training of staff displaced by automation and customer/consumer education still lags behind^[19], the use of recycle notes, unfit notes (Mutilated) failed transactions.

The above challenges necessitate the research work on the customers experience on the failed transaction while using ATM's channel for their transactions and cash withdrawals.

Statement of the Problem

According to the bankers committee, the skillful implementation of the full utilization of the Automated Teller Machine is determined by the success and failure of the Nigerian banks in achieving its objectives. The degrees to which each bank is strongly committed functionality and the performance of the machine is determined by the rate of complain or feedback received from the customers. The problem of the machine such as low or epileptic network, use of unfit notes faulty machines and unstable power are the major determinant of the Automated Teller Machines performance. There is need for the banks to put in place measures to curtail the menace of the failed transactions there by depriving their customers from accessing their fund as at when due. The apex bank i.e. central bank of Nigeria has just introduced the cashless system. Policy but have not enforce or left these aspect half way or unaddressed.

On the other hand, the banks also contribute to the failure of the transaction by not orienting the customers on how to operate or use the Automated Teller Machines. Since the machines are configured with some error sign that display on the machine screen while performing the transaction e.g. unable to dispense cash". ATM network is down. You can visit any nearest machine near you etc. However banks customer experience is key as it the only tool that make them to be loyal customer there by becoming their ambassador out side the banking environment. Since the automated machine is gaining ground by the customer, bank are suppose to check every machineries in order to curtail the problems associated with ATM and prompt resolution of the failed transaction if it occurs so as to avoid customers desertification or depositors running away from their banks.

Objectives of the Study

The main objective of this study is to examine the effect of customers experience on refund of ATM failed transaction of banks in Maiduguri Metropolis. Other specific objectives of the study were to:-

- i. examine the duration and urgency its take to refund customers money
- ii. assesses the type of refund system common in the selected banks in Maiduguri
- iii. examine the impact of network failure on customer's dissatisfaction of use of ATM
- iv. assess the effect of refund on customer's patronage of the affected banks.
- v. examine the causes of transaction failures in usage of Automated Teller Machines in Maiduguri
- vi. Assesses the level of awareness of customers of the ATM failed transaction and refund system.

a. Research Questions

- i. How long does it take to refund a customer's cash arising from ATM failed transactions?
- ii. What are the types of ATM refund systems that are common in your banks?
- iii. What are the impacts of ATM failure on customer's satisfaction and dissatisfaction?
- iv. What are the effects of the ATM refund system on customer patronage?
- v. What are the courses of ATM transaction failure?
- vi. What is the level of awareness of customers on refund of ATM failed transaction?

b. Hypothesis

- i. There is no significant relationship between the refund system of ATM failed transactions and customers satisfaction in Maiduguri

- ii. There is no significant relationship between the refund system of ATM failed transactions and customer patronage of the selected banks in Maiduguri

c. Significance of the Study

The significance of this study lies on almost all the financial institutions especially for the Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN) in policy formulation on the refund system adopted by the commercial banks on failed transaction as a result of ATM usage, which will assist in enforcing the cashless policy established in the year 2010. It will also assist researchers who will like to write on issues related to ATM and its related discoveries.

The study also will make the banks to keep up with the competitive nature of their environment which depend on the quality of product and services they offered e.g. the usage of the ATM and how fast they attend a refunds on failed transactions of their customer. It is also important that this study be done so that customers who are not aware/oriented on the refund of ATM failed transactions can be educated on the need to be so, because many customers has lost or for fit their fund on the cause by using the Automated Teller Machine.

The study is also significant because it provide the empirical information on the root cause of Automated Teller Machine failed transactions, and also sensitize the banks the need to harmonize the ATM refund system with aim of prompt resolution of all customers complaint on failed transaction on ATM to avoid customers dissatisfaction.

d. Scope and Limitation of the Study

This research examined the effect of customers experience on ATM refund system on failed transaction in the financial institution such as banks. It will examine the nature and reason for ATM failed transaction and the refund system in all the banks operating in Maiduguri Metropolis. The document use for this study is administering of questionnaire to customer of all the banks and conducting of personal interview to the staff of the banks handing the e-banking desk on how to handle/treat customers complain on refund of failed transaction. It will also focus on the factors that courses the ATM failed transaction and the refund systems of ATM failed transaction in all the banks in Maiduguri metropolis since the bank's capitalization in 2009 to date (i.e. 4 years)

The limitation of the is study is the problem in gathering facts and figures due to security challenges in the town, the researcher encountered serious problem in administering the questionnaire. It took a lot of time and patience to get the appropriate customers for the target bank to fill and return questionnaires. Conducting interview with the banks staff was not easy as most of the time they were busy attending to customers while getting access to the document was not also easy because there are a few write up on ATM for now. Finally, time constrain is another limitation in the conduct of this research study which was a result of the researchers engagement in the office and security changes in the town and its environs.

e. Definition Of Term

ATM – Automated Teller machine

ICT – Information and Communication Technology

Inter Switch – It is the switching company that mediate between all banks

NCR – National cash Register

CBN – Central Bank of Nigeria

UPS – Uninterrupted Power Supply

PHCN – Power Holding Company of Nigeria

Extra switch – This is an Application deployed by inter switched for dispute resolution among banks.

Dispense Error – occur when customer request for a particular amount of money and no cash was presented or part of the cash was presented.

On-us transaction: Customer uses his card on his bank. Automated Teller Machine

Not-on-us transaction – using other banks card on other Automated Teller Machine

Remote-on-us – Other bank card on, Other Banks Automated Teller Machine

Arbiter: An extranet application powered by inter switch to resolve customer (inter bank) issues.

EFT – Electronic Fund Transfer

FEP – Front End Processing.

TAM – Technology Adoption Model

II. Literature Review

2.0 Introduction

This reviews related literature available from textbooks, journals, seminars papers and case studies on the ATM refund system on failed transactions in Nigerian Deposit Money Banks. This is done with a view to have a very good understanding of the subject as well as making proper references. These are:

- i. Brief history of ATM and refund system in Nigeria
- ii. Duration and urgency of ATM refund.
- iii. Types of ATM refund system in Nigerian Commercial Banks.
- iv. Impact of ATM failure on customer's dissatisfaction.
- v. Effect of ATM refund system on customer's patronage.
- vi. Causes of ATM failed transaction.
- vii. Level of awareness of customers on ATM failed transaction refund system.

2.1 Brief History of ATM and ATM Refund System

The Commercial Banks world-over continue to invest heavily in Information Technology (IT) and over recent years have begun to employ the use of ATM to support a range of innovative banking services with the aim of improving service relationships^[8]. Automated Teller Machine services provide the ability to perform banking transaction without going into the banking hall for counter transaction, the impact of cultural differences between countries on the effectiveness and efficiency of (IT) deployment has been recognize as a research issue worthy of investigation^[19]. Automated Teller Machine (ATM) began operations at a branch of Barclays Bank in 1967. According to^[18] an ATM combines a computer terminal record keeping system and cash vault in one unit permitting customer to use their plastic card using personal identification number (PIN) into a computer terminal link to the financial forms computerized records 24 hours a day and once accessed cash withdrawal may be made up to a limit allowed.

^[15] Stated that the wonders of modern computer technology have also enable banks to lower the cost of bank transaction by having the customers interacting with electronic banking facilities rather than with human being. One of the important functions of ATM is that it does not have to be paid customers over time and never sleeps, thus being available for use 24 hours a day. Not only does this result in cheaper transactions for the bank but it also provide a more convenience for the customer's. Furthermore, because of it low cost. Automated Teller Machine can be put in a location or other than a bank or its branch premises, further increasing customer's convenience. The low cost of Automated Teller Machines has meant that they have sprung up everywhere. Although Automated Teller Machine was introduce in the Nigerian Banking industries in early 2000 and most banks embraced its use after the 2005 banks consolidation. Today, there is hardly any bank without the Automated Teller Machine. The banks have also deployed the ATM's to other location as earlier stated. Locations such as supermarket, tertiary institutions, hospitals, hotels, airports, ministries and so on now have a machine situated in their premises. However, there is no doubt that the introduction of ATM's by banks is to reduce operation costs and to ensure that the customers are better served, but the ATM's has it challenges due to the fact that the infrastructures that support the machines are susceptible to abuse, misuse and failure in many ways causing customer's dissatisfaction and loss of confidence on the use of Automated Teller Machine. The infrastructures attributed to the failure of Automated Teller Machine are power failure, network problem. Recycle Notes, and ATM not loaded with cash.

Customers face great challenges for the refund of the failed transaction. This is because there is no clear direction or policy by CBN on the means or ways to refund the transaction. The banks through inter switch network monitors failed transactions on other bank's ATM are to report and process their claim through their banks. Failed transaction of customer of the same ATM and card are to process through their claims in their banks (i.e. on us and not on us).

The refund system is categorized into three (3) i.e. Automatic refund, 24 hours refund and log against the bank to which the transaction failed on their ATM. Customer's suffers a lot because of the non standardized means of refund. Customer's satisfaction is ultimately the result of the sum total of the customers experience

with every organization. According to ^[9] "It isn't what you think you know is important. It's what customers think that matters even if they are illogical, uninformed or witless". Good services have to do with what customers believe it to be. Few employers truly understand what good services are, not are they close enough to their own employees to understand how bad and inconsistent services are in their respective branches. Customers come back to a place that has provided a quality experience for them. This means managers need to focus not on tangibles as ends in them, but on how all the workers particularly combine to create a certain satisfying experience to the customer ^[9].

Poor network is causing the end customers transactions to slow down or fail but the operators does not know where the issue is they don't know how long the problem has exist, how many transactions are being affected or whether the problem is related to a specific Automated Teller Machine terminal, an inter bank connections, an electronic fund transfer (EFT) network, perhaps it may be the banks payment switch or an internal network communications issue, the longer the guessing game goes on, the greater the impact on support cost, revenue generation and customers loyalty. The performance management strategy that combines deep due Automated Teller Machines performance metrics, transactions response times and real time analytics on the end customers experience is the key to cost effective management timely problem resolution and consistent end customer service reliability.

The conceptual framework this study is based on is the combined principle of the Technology Adoption Model (TAM) ^[5]. TAM seeks to explain consciously intended behaviours across a wide range of end-user technology and user population ^[5]. It is used because of the models used in information system to study the acceptance of technology "TAM is arguably the most parsimonious and widely accepted" ^[19]. The failure of this transaction is mostly attributed to technological problems like the inter bank connection electronic fund transactions for network, Bank payment switch" or internal network communication which the banks are suppose to make sure that they are uninterrupted so that the end users does not suffer or experience non dispense of cash while trying to use the Automated Teller Machine as their alternate channel of transaction. ^[11] Stated that some customer "takes the bull by the horns" by going to the court to seek redress. The suit was file against some banks for failure to refund some failed transactions of some customers. The plaintiffs further prayed a declaration that CBN failed in its regulatory duty to promote monetary stability and sound financial system in relation to the electronic withdrawals.

Notably, On 17th May, 2010 CBN issued standard and guidelines on ATM operations spelling out conditions for liability for ATM fraud, but has not spell categorically on ATM failed transaction making banks reluctant on the refund system. ^[2] Submitted that having identified the challenges of ATM from both the banks and customers perspective, the suggested solutions to solving such challenges is the collaboration of all the stakeholders namely the regulatory bodies, banks and customers. The CBN as the apex to come up with clear cut of the refund system by the banks which will be part of our recommendation at the end of this study.

2.2 Duration and Urgency of ATM Refund

According to the power conferred on the banks by section 28 (1) (b) of the Central Bank of Nigeria Act 2007 (as amended) issue guidelines, rules and standard state that all dispute resolution (i.e. irregularities in the account by an ATM customer arising from the use of card on ATM should be treated within a maximum of 72 hours from the date of receipt of the complain. It state that failure to respond to the customer or to the CBN on the complain within 72 hours will attract a fine of ₦50,000 per day for each complain after the 72 hours until the response is received. However some banks has automate their system while some have not. According to the managing director, inter switch accused bank of not filling reports that would ensured payment of refund as early as possible. That is inability of the bank to treat the claim urgently affect the refund. The duration and urgency of refund in most of the banks are either automatic, 24 hours or visit the bank for them to log your claim against the bank that trap your cash which most at time depend on when they respond.

2.3 Types of ATM Refund System in Commercial Banks

According to Keystone Bank Ltd. Standard operating procedure (SOP) for ATM refund system classified into four (4) categories.

- a) Automatic refund system
- b) On us refund system

- c) Not on us refund system
- d) Remote on us refund system
- a) Automatic refund system is the refund that the transaction reversed itself if it was not successful (i.e. cash has not been dispensed by the ATM and it mostly occurs when there is no cash in the ATM or network fluctuation. This type of refund applies to all the ATMs of every bank, example Access Bank card on GTB ATM.
- b) On us refund system, this type of refund occurs when customer uses its bank ATM and the cash is trapped. If the transaction has not refunded automatically the refund is made after 24 hours using e. journal which normally downloaded on the ATM.
- c) Not on us (other Bank ATM level on another bank ATM machine (example Keystone Bank ATM card on Zenith Bank ATM Machine). This type of refund system is handled by the customer's domiciled branch or Bank if the transaction does not reverse itself automatically, the transaction is logged by the domiciled branch or bank through an agreed site called arbiter controlled by Inter Switch Nigeria Ltd. (i.e. the electronic settlement company for the refund of the failed transaction.
- d) Remote on us (mother Bank card on other ATM). These types of system is said to be remote on the ATM terminal because his account is not link directly to the ATM he is using the credit or his withdrawal or refund comes through inter switch. This type of refund system is been treated by the domiciled branch by login it on arbiter for the claim. The two refund system above (c and d) is logged on arbiter. The affected bank has 4 working days to accept or reject the request. The four refund system mention applies to all the commercial bank since all their cards are used on every machine. Irrespective of the bank and the settlement system, all channel is the same (i.e. inter switch) through the arbiter. The regulatory body too is the same that is the Central Bank of Nigeria.

In processing refund, there are of two types: partial dispense and none dispense.

- a) Partial dispense: this occur when the machine debited you but pays you part of the amount requested.
- b) None dispense: occur when the machine debited you without dispensing any cash requested.

2.4 Impact of ATM Failure on Customers Dissatisfaction

Macmillan School Dictionary defined dissatisfaction as the state of attitude of not being satisfied, discontent and displeasure or a particular cause of feeling of displeasure or disappointment. NCR Interactive Teller Posit that the retail banking customers environment is changing due to dissatisfaction with customer services. Analysts' surveys advice that over a third of global retail banking customers moved providers in 2011, losing this segment of customers reduces the opportunity to seal the ATM as an e-banking product at the branches there by negatively impacting profitability and growth of the financial institution. Bank customers feel disappointed upset because his demand at that particular time has not been achieved there by affecting him negatively. Experience shows that customers do break the card due to the failure of the ATM to dispense cash requested at a particular point of needs. ATM failure make customer to be dissatisfied which affect the banks customer base by loosing the customer to the other competitors. Similarly by delivering high level of customer's satisfaction, it improves customer's loyalty to the organization. The ATM failure affect customer's patronage and acceptance/adoption as it erode customer's confidence on the product.

2.5 Effect of ATM Refund System on Customers Patronage

There has been transformation of the Nigerian Banking Industries after consolidation exercise in 2005 by Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN).^[2] Assert that maximizing returns and optimizing profitability became the focus of banks and these can only be achieved through enhance patronages; that is increased customer base with attendant satisfaction sufficient to consolidated loyalty. The banks are therefore confronted with delivering their services in the most efficient ways, using ATM as means to deliver additional product and services.

^[10] Identified bank customers' perception of service quality dimensions using quantitative techniques. The authors conceptualized internet service quality base on three quality perspective, banking service product quality, customer service quality and online system quality.

According to the Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN) directive that all ATM refund must be reversed within 72 hours from the date of complain but this is not fully implemented there by affecting customers patronage.

Customers perceive greater risks when buying services than tangible goods^[21]. ATM is a technology enable channel and consumers view the use of ATM as a risky decision because technology enable services exhibit invasive technological, unfamiliar and indefinite stimuli.^[5] Therefore when customers decide to use the ATM, they are exposed to uncertainties such as the availability. The compatibility and performance of the complementary ATM channels^[19] Experience shows that some customers close their account, stop using the (i.e. patronizing the ATM, discouraging their friends and relatives from the use of the ATM due to delay in the refund system.

2.6 Causes of ATM Failed Transaction

ATM failed transaction refers to one of the following or other similar events:-

- (i) Account of the customer is debited with the amount of intended withdrawal but no cash is dispensed by the ATM.
- (ii) Account of the customer is debited with the amount of intended withdrawal but the entire amount of transaction is not dispensed by the ATM e.g. the account debited with N10,000 but only N5,000 one dispensed by the ATM.
- (iii) Account of the customer is debited with the amount of intended withdrawal but the customer leaves the ATM before collecting the cash and the cash is either retracted by the ATM or is collected by another person after the customer has left the ATM.
- (iv) The customer make a withdrawal (say N5,000 and his/her account gets debited with double the amount (say N10,000). Some ATM failed transactions automatically get credited bank into the account of the customers. These are the transactions that the ATM itself or the back-end server (called "Switch") marks as failed or unsuccessful. Other causes of ATM failed transaction can be as a result of the following reasons:-
 - (a) ATM may be out of cash but for some reasons, the ATM software fails to recognize the same because customers account are being debited before cash dispense processes is prompted in such cases, obviously no cash will be dispensed but the transaction will get marked as successful.
 - (b) Wrong denomination of notes occurs when the cash handling agency or the bank staff put wrong denomination in the ATM cassette or tray. The ATM has 4 cassettes/tray label 1 – 4 which takes different notes depending on the bank's ATM standard. The cassette/tray is configured to take different denomination say tray 1 – 1,000, tray 2 – 500 or tray 1 and 2 N1,000 notes and tray 3 and 4 – 500 as in Keystone Bank Nigeria Limited. The ATM recognized denomination and pieces in the trays to know the amount requested and dispense. So if 1,000 notes is mistakingly put in tray 3 (500 notes). Any withdrawal there will be an overage to the customer and shortage to the bank and 500 notes in tray 1 and 2 will be an shortage to the customer and overage to the bank leading to what is called partial dispense or failed transaction.
 - (c) Network or power failure. The process flow of the ATM is that customers account is debited before cash is dispense when the customers request for cash and his account debited and network or power failure occur before the ATM dispense cash, the transaction will be marked as successful in the system but no cash will be dispensed by the ATM.
 - (d) Technical/mechanical snag in the ATM. There may be a physical fault e.g. reject tray full, faulty rollers and clamps, dispensers etc and or software e.g. the front-end processed (FEP) fault in the ATM resulting in non-dispensation of cash after a success response from the switch.
 - (e) Use of unfit notes/mutilated notes. Bank use recycle note or mutilated notes in the ATM which filled up the reject trays while trying to count the requested amount by the customers which lead to a failed transaction.

2.7 Level of Awareness of Customers on ATM Failed Transaction Refund System

The CBN in 2011 directed all banks to refund customers failed transaction within 72 hours of experiencing default but most customers are not aware thereby exposing them to lost of their fund through the use of the ATM which indirectly or directly affect the customers acceptance and invariable the cashless. state that the inability of customers to understand the workings of the ATMs has affected electronic payment system in the country and also make the banks to create awareness on the mechanism and usage of the ATM and asking

customers to report to the banks or their call centre when anomalies occurs while processing withdrawing money through ATM. Most customers are not aware of the ATM refund and the refund system of failed transaction by Nigerian banks (The Nation 2013).

The apex bank (CBN 2011) imposed a daily fine of N50, 000 on banks for failure to respond to customer complain after 72 hours of such complain and most of the customers are not aware of this policy. Customer's awareness is the key to customer service and satisfaction.

III. Introduction

The aim of this paper is to examine the extent of effect of customer's experience on ATM failed transaction and its effects on Deposit Money Banks. The research work also seeks to find possible solution to the problem highlighted earlier. To arrive at this, attempt was made towards identifying the relevant research method and the framework under which problem can be resolved in order to have a reasonable flow.

3.1 Research Design

Research design is the framework for the research study. It provides guidelines which direct the researcher toward solving the research problems and it vary depending on the nature of the problem being studied.

This study examines the effect of customers experience on ATM failed transaction in commercial banks in Maiduguri metropolis. It will therefore present in details how the data will be examine and analysed. The work involves statistical solution and technique in conducting the study. In addition, data will be presented according to the research questions. And attempt will be made to appraise the effort against the research frame in order to determine the extent to which such effort have or have not been able to meet the expectation of the customers, the society and the commercial banks in Nigeria in general.

3.2 Population of the Study

Research population is the totality of all element, subject or members that posses a specific set of one or more common features. A population could be finite or infinite the population under study is a finite type, which comprised the entire commercial bank customer in Maiduguri metropolis. The customer of all the commercial bank are group according to the bank name e.g. Zenith Bank Plc, Keystone Bank Ltd., unity Bank Plc, Diamond Bank Plc, Guaranty Trust Bank Plc, Mainstreet Bank Ltd., First City Monument Bank Plc, UBA Plc, Skye Bank Plc, Union Bank Plc, Stanbic IBTC Bank, Fidelity Bank Plc and First Bank Nigerian Plc. The customers of the above banks are expected to answer the questionnaire to a reasonable level.

3.3 Sampling Techniques and Sample Size

A population may be finite yet, so vast that only a sample could be used for research purpose. In practice, most of the information obtained by researchers about any population comes from examining a simple representation subset of the population. This is called sample. The total population o customers of all the commercial bank in Maiduguri metropolis is estimated to be and are selected as sample size. The choice or the sample sized was informed by the nature of the problem. To conduct this research, a purpose sampling technique to select the sample areas was adopted. Also, the random sampling is the method adopted by the researcher in determining the sample size. This method allows for every unit of the population to have equal probability of chance of being selected from the population for this study.

3.4 Data Collection Instrument

The sources of data for this work is basically the primary source therefore the use of personal interview observation and administration of questionnaires as tools was adequately used to collect relevant data. The questionnaires were addressed to the customers of the commercial banks of Maiduguri metropolis in order to collect valid and reliable data for this study. The secondary sources of data collected include the internal source and external source. Internal secondary source include annual reports, news letters etc., while external source include the medical and commercial magazines, the data for this research will be collected through the use of questionnaire administration to the customers of all the commercial banks in Maiduguri Metropolis.

3.5 Method Of Data Analysis

In this section the researcher is concerned with reducing the data collected, after the data gathering to such a size and shape that it be easily comprehended as well as enable the extraction of new information from it. The simple percentage method for the analysis of open-ended questionnaires as well as the individual questionnaires would be used for comparison. The data would also be organized and presented in table with brief interpretation and discussion. The data analysis would be based solely on the completed questionnaires after critically analyzing the result.

IV. Data Presentation and Analysis

4.0 Introduction

This study seeks to investigate the effects of failed ATM transactions on customer experience with this electronic banking service in Maiduguri, the Maiduguri State Capital. The study produced a data set from a sample of 675 bank customers drawn from all the 15 commercial banks operating in Maiduguri. The data was collected through the cross-sectional survey method. A questionnaire made up of 23 options without respondents' personal data was administered in a field survey on the selected sample. The data thus collected was analyzed using the descriptive statistics. The focus of the analysis addressed the objectives of the research: a sketch of the respondents' demographic characteristics, their experience with ATM transactions, the manner and efficiency of service recovery following failed ATM transaction, determination of system-induced and human-caused service failure, and overall level of customer awareness of electronic banking services and the challenges thereto. Eight (8) key themes identified from the data analysis are presented in this chapter based on a thematic rearrangement of the questionnaire items. The result of this analysis is discussed and interpreted against the backlog of the relevant theories and principles reviewed under chapter two.

4.1 Presentation of Data

As stated above, data presentation was made based on an 8-point thematic rearrangement of the items on the questionnaire: namely, demographic characteristics of respondents; respondents' experience with ATM service failure; respondents' awareness of ATM refund systems in Nigerian banks; the nature of the refund system; respondents' perception of the efficiency of the refund system; effects of ATM service failure on the respondents; and respondents' level of satisfaction with the service recovery system following ATM service failure in Nigerian banks.

4.1.1 Demographic Characteristics of the Respondents

Table 4.1 below summarized the demographic characteristics of the survey respondents.

Table 4.1. Distribution of Respondents by Demographics

Demographic Variables	Responses	
	Frequency	%
Age (in years)		
18 – 27	285	42.22
28 – 37	285	42.22
38 – 47	75	11.11
48 – 57	30	4.44
58 and above	0	0.00
Sex		
Male	630	93.33
Female	45	6.67
Qualification		
Masters	30	4.44
HND/BSc/B.Ed./B.Tech	360	53.33
Diploma/NCE/Advanced Diploma	240	35.56
GCE/SSCE	45	5.45
Marital Status		
Married	345	51.11
Single	330	48.89
Separated/Divorced	0	0.00

Source: Field survey, 2014

The age of the respondents ranged from just above 18 to 47, with just about 4.44% over the 48 year threshold. The largest chunk of the respondents (84.44%) falls under the age bracket 18 – 37. The sample for age was further subdivided into four main sub-groups of 18-27, 28-37, 38-47 and 48 and above. The highest was the 18-27, 28-37 groups each with 42.22% reflecting well on the mean of the age of the entire group followed by the 38-47 groups making up just 11.11% of the sample respondents. The respondents are overwhelmingly male (93.33%), but almost equally divided among the married (51.11%) and the unmarried (48.89%). Exactly 57.78% of the respondents are graduates, and just 5.45% were secondary school graduates. In general, all the respondents are literate, and therefore can be expected to relate well with the electronic banking services.

4.1.2 Customer Experience of ATM Service Failure

Table 4.2 below captures customers’ experience with ATM service, with emphasis on service failures they experience in the process of trying to withdraw some cash from the ATMs. It should be noted that over 35% of the respondents reported using the ATMs for more than 5 years, a long enough time to enable them appreciate the downside of using such services. Apparently, there is a lot of such service failures experienced by customers from the 15 commercial banks operating in Maiduguri, a more than three quarters of the sampled respondents reported having experienced ATM service failure. Such failures, the respondents averred, mostly emanates from cash outage (meaning than the machines are not regularly loaded with cash when they run empty, especially over the weekends); but significantly from network failures (where the teller machines are unable to gain access to customers’ accounts on account of poor signals in the intranet connectivity).

Table 4.2. Distribution of Respondents by Experience of ATM Service Failure

Variables	Responses	
	Frequency	%
<i>Usage of ATM (in Years)</i>		
< – 1	45	6.67
1 – 2	195	28.89
2 – 5	195	28.89
> 5	240	35.56
<i>Have you experience ATM service failure?</i>		
Yes	525	77.78
No	150	22.22
<i>Reasons for ATM Service Failure</i>		
Power outage	0	0.00
Network failure	510	75.56
Cash outage	165	24.44

Source: Field survey, 2014

4.1.3 Customer Awareness of ATM Refund System (Service Recovery)

Service failure and recovery is a critical issue for bank managers. This is because no matter the superiority of a recovery effort following ATM service failure, the damage has already been made on the image of the bank in the eyes of the aggrieved customer. Hence, banks spend a lot of effort and resources in sensitizing their customers on the possibility of ATM failures and the recovery alternative open to the customer. In this study, it has been shown in Table 4.3 that just a little over half of the surveyed customers are actually aware of the refund system when ATMs failed to dish out cash to customers but the failed transaction is yet logged as debit entry on the customers’ accounts. Most of these respondents became aware of the refund system through the efforts of their bankers (51.03%), but a significant number (35.64%) came to be aware of the service recovery window only through their friends; and around 13% were sensitized through the campaign efforts of the Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN).

Table 4.3. Distribution of Respondents by Awareness of ATM Refund System

Variables	Responses	
	Frequency	%
<i>Are you aware of ATM refund in Nigerian banks?</i>		
Yes	390	57.78
No	285	42.22
<i>If "Yes," how did you know about it?</i>		
My bank's customer awareness campaign	199	51.03
CBN's awareness campaign	52	13.33
Friends	139	35.64
<i>ATM refund system for failed ATM transactions</i>		
On us	375	55.56
Not on us	225	33.33
Remote on us	75	11.11

Source: Field survey, 2014

As to the customers awareness of the types of refund system their respective banks use, the survey result show that 55.56% of the customers believe that a refund is made when the failed transaction occurs on one's own bank. This implies that majority of the respondents believe that they really stand to lose their money in the event of ATM transaction failure on an ATM not their banks'. Hence, a great majority fail to avail themselves the convenience of using the nearest available ATM, but rather will travel long distance to make cash withdrawals on their bank's ATMs only. However, about 39% do use ATMs other than their bank's because they are aware that a refund system is also available to them in the event of service failure. Only a negligible per cent of the respondents are actually well aware of a remote refund system.

4.1.4 Effect of Successful/Failed Refund System on Customers' Morale

The respondents were asked to rate how they feel after a failed ATM transaction is successfully recovered. As shown in Table 4.4, 66.67% reported feeling relieved when the failed transaction is successfully remedied. This feeling is akin to that felt by a person on recovering some lost valuables. However, this positive emotional outcome is only identifiable with those who nurse strong loyalty to the bank. Those not so strongly loyal (between 4%—17%) may still exhibit dampened morale as a result of the service failure.

Table 4.4. Effect of Successful/Failed Refund System on Customers' Morale

Variables	Responses	
	Frequency	%
<i>My morale is positively affected by early refund awareness</i>		
Agree	450	66.67
Strongly agree	105	15.56
Not decided	90	13.33
Disagree	30	4.44
Strongly disagree	0	0.00
<i>My morale is negatively affected by late refund awareness</i>		
Agree	345	51.11
Strongly agree	90	13.33
Not decided	105	15.56
Disagree	135	20.00
Strongly disagree	0	0.00

Source: Field survey, 2014

How do the customers really feel when the service recovery following ATM transaction failure is a failure itself? The result of this survey in Table 4.4 shows that more than half of the customers feel demoralised; however, a significant number of the customers (20%)—apparently from among those who are staunchly loyal to their banks—feel that a failed service recovery effort make no impact on their morale, and therefore commitment, to the bank and the services they receive from them. This may not be unconnected with the fact that most people in Maiduguri, especially salary account holders, rarely see any difference between one bank and the other as they simply keep using them as conduits for the receipt of their monthly salaries only.

4.1.5 Customers' Perception of the Efficiency of the ATM Refund System

Table 4.5 below details respondents' perception of the efficiency with which failed ATM transactions are corrected by banks operating in Maiduguri.

Table 4.5. Respondents' Experience of ATM Refund System Efficiency

Variables	Responses	
	Frequency	%
<i>How long does it take to refund failed ATM transaction?</i>		
Automatic	105	15.56
After 24 hours	225	33.33
After more than 24 hours	345	51.11
<i>Has your bank responded with utmost urgency to failure?</i>		
Yes	315	46.67
No	270	40.00
Not sure	90	13.33
<i>Ever lost money to failed ATM transaction?</i>		
Yes	75	11.11
No	510	75.56
Cannot recall	90	13.33
<i>Did you have cash at hand that cushioned an ATM transaction failure?</i>		
Yes	255	37.78
No	420	62.22
<i>Ever surprised by an automatically reversed ATM failure?</i>		
Yes	345	51.11
No	225	33.33
Cannot recall	105	15.56

Source: Field survey, 2014

Data in Table 4.5 indicates above that more than half of the respondents believe that it takes several days for an ATM failed transaction to be rectified. This places the customer in an awkward situation, especially where they have pressing needs to address with the cash from the attempted withdrawal; the situation is even worse where those customers (62.22% of them) who have no cash at hand and the little balance they had was trapped in the failed transaction. The system is just 15.56% efficient. This is an unacceptable situation, as it points to gross inefficiency and colossal costs of the ATM system as a whole. The fact that the refund system is not so efficient doesn't mean that customers are routinely made to lose money to failed ATM transactions. This is indicated by the response of 75.56% of the customers surveyed who reported never having lost money to failed ATM transactions. The urgent manner the customer care people in the banks attend to customer complaints 46.67% of the time in this regard may have help in obviating withdrawal loses to customer, yet this is not enough as 40% of the time complaining customer are not well attended to. Some of the customers (11.11%) even end up losing the amount in failed ATM transaction. Only a negligible few (they can be said to be merely lucky) ever experienced instant and automatic reversal of a failed ATM transaction.

4.1.6 Customers' Satisfaction with the ATM Refund System

The inefficiency of the refund system instituted as the main recovery strategy for ATM service failure left 57.78% of the customers not satisfied with the service rendered (see Table 4.6 below). Only 37.78% of the respondents are in any way satisfied; those who are "not sure" can equally be classified with the unsatisfied. As data in Table 4.6 further shows, even those customers (60% of them) who go shopping for the best ATM service from the available banks in Maiduguri met with no better service, as 84.44% reported that it takes some time before failed transactions could be reversed (delayed transaction reversal). Again, only the lucky few (15.56%) end up enjoying automatic reversal of failed transactions.

Table 4.6. Respondents' Satisfaction with the ATM Refund System

Variables	Responses	
	Frequency	%
<i>Satisfied with the time limit an ATM service failure was treated?</i>		
Yes	255	37.78
No	390	57.78
Not sure	30	4.44
<i>Experienced a difference from other banks' treatment of ATM service failure?</i>		
Yes	405	60.00
No	270	40.00
<i>If "Yes," what is the nature of the different treatment received?</i>		
Instant transaction reversal	63	15.56
Delayed transaction reversal	342	84.44

Source: Field survey, 2014

4.1.7 Effects of ATM Transaction Failure on Customers

According to the disconfirmation paradigm of customer satisfaction (McCullough, Berry and Yadav, 2000), customers compare perceived product performance to expectations. Performance that exceeds expectations is *positively disconfirmed*, performance that meets expectations is *confirmed*, and performance that falls short of expectations is *negatively disconfirmed*. In general, the more negative the disconfirmation, the greater the dissatisfaction, whereas the more positive the disconfirmation, the greater the satisfaction. Table 4.7 reveals the impact of ATM transaction failure on customers' satisfaction in Maiduguri. Customer satisfaction was found to be lower after service failure and recovery (even given high-recovery performance) than in the case of error-free service. Specifically, Table 4.7 reveals that customers surveyed feel "disappointed" (48.89%), "upset" (28.89%), and "bad" (22.22%). All these portend negative cognitive dissonance with regards to the service, and hence the universal dissatisfaction with ATM services in Maiduguri.

Table 4.7. Effects of ATM Service Failure on Respondents

Variables	Responses	
	Frequency	%
<i>How did you feel following an ATM service failure?</i>		
Disappointed	330	48.89
Bad	150	22.22
Upset	195	28.89
<i>ATM service failure affect my willingness to patronise the bank again</i>		
Agree	255	37.78
Strongly agree	30	4.44
Not decided	210	31.11
Disagree	150	22.22
Strongly disagree	30	4.44
<i>ATM service failure made me think of switching to another bank</i>		
Agree	210	31.11
Strongly agree	60	8.89
Not decided	225	33.33
Disagree	135	20.00
Strongly disagree	45	6.67
<i>ATM failure discourages one from recommending the bank to others</i>		
Agree	255	37.78
Strongly agree	30	4.44
Not decided	135	20.00
Disagree	210	31.11
Strongly disagree	45	6.67

Source: Field survey, 2014

The customer dissatisfaction revealed above has further implications: namely, the customer willingness to patronise banks after service failure, customers switching from one bank to another, and refusal to recommend the services of the banks to others. It was shown (Table 4.7) that more than 40% of the respondents

become unwilling to patronise a bank once they experience ATM transaction failure; starts shopping for other banks whose ATMs provide better services; and generally refuse to put in the good word on behalf of the bank whose ATM failed them in their hour of need.

4.1.8 Respondents’ Recommended Service Recovery Measures

In the event of ATM service failure, banks are expected to deploy some recovery measures not only to avoid litigation from customers but also to remain competitive in the industry. To this end, the respondents to this survey recommended the measures listed in Table 4.8 below. It should be noted that their most pressing concern is to see an effective and efficient ATM service in Maiduguri in order to mitigate the suffering on long queues and failed transactions. To this end, the most important recommendations are to ensure efficient network connectivity, fully loaded ATMs 24/7, and widespread availability of the ATMs.

Table 4.8. Respondents’ Suggested Measures to ATM Service Failure

Measures Suggested by Respondents	Responses	
	Frequency	%
Load money on the ATMs 24/7	503	74.52
Increase the number of functional ATMs	448	66.37
Proper maintenance of ATMs to avoid fail transactions	633	93.78
Improve ATM connectivity for prompt refund	567	84.00
Make ATMs available in areas outside Maiduguri	611	90.52
Faithful implementation of ATM guidelines	499	73.93
Sustained sensitization campaigns on refund systems	599	88.74
Prompt and polite attention to customer complains	500	74.07
Reduced lead time in the refund process	671	99.41
Improve on the inter-switch for various card types	544	80.59
Prompt refund other than automatic transaction reversal	597	88.44

4.2 Test of Hypotheses

The hypotheses formulated in the first chapter of this study are now tested on the strength of the information presented above. The test is conducted through the application of Chi-Square Distribution. For each test of significance, a null hypothesis of no difference with regards to the variable tested was used based on 0.05 level of alpha.

4.2.1 Test of Hypothesis 1:

Hypothesis 1, together with its alternative variant, is restated below:

H_0 : That there is no significant relationship between the refund systems of ATM failed transaction and customers’ satisfaction.

The X^2 test statistics is formulated as follows:

$$X^2 = \sum \frac{(O - E)^2}{E}$$

where, O = Observed frequency

E = Expected frequency

Data extracted from Table 4.6 was used in the test. The X^2 critical value, which is the standard of comparison, was computed as follows:

Level of alpha = 5%

Degree of freedom (v) = $(K - 1) (R - 1)$, where K is the number of column and R is the numbers of row.

Therefore, $v = (3 - 1) (2)$

= $(2)(1)$

= 2.

Reading from the X^2 table (see Appendix III), the tabulated X^2 critical value is 48.78 at 2df and 0.05 level of alpha. Now, the decision rule was that if X^2 value ≤ 48.78 , H_0 is accepted; if otherwise it is rejected.

Using the data extracted from Table 4.6, the observed X^2 value was computed as follows:

Table 4.13: Computation of Observed X² Value – Hypothesis 1

Satisfied with refund system?	O	E	O – E	(O – E) ²	$\frac{(O - E)^2}{E}$
Yes	255	225	30	900	4
No	390	225	165	27,225	121
Not sure	30	225	-195	38,025	169
	675	675	0	66,150	294

From the above computation, the observed X² is 294. This result implies that there is significant relationship between the refund systems of ATM failed transaction and customers’ satisfaction (X²=294, df=2, p=0.05). In other words, the null hypothesis was rejected with 95% level of confidence.

4.2.2 Test of Hypothesis 2:

Hypothesis 2, together with its alternative variant, is restated below:

H₀: That there is no significant relationship between the refund systems of ATM failed transaction and customer patronage of the selected banks.

H₁: That there is significant relationship between the refund systems of ATM failed transaction and customer patronage of the selected banks.

Data extracted from Table 4.7 was used in the test. The X² critical value was computed as follows:

Level of alpha = 5%

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Degree of freedom (v)} &= (K-1)(R-1) \\ &= (5-1)(2-1) \\ &= 4 \end{aligned}$$

Reading from the X² table the tabulated X² critical value is 69.09 at 4df and 0.05 level of significance.

Now, the decision rule was that if X² value ≤ 69.09, H₀ will be accepted; if otherwise it is rejected.

Using the data in Table 4.12, the observed X² value was computed as follows:

Table 4.14: Computation of Observed X² Value – Hypothesis 2

ATM refund system influences customer patronage	O	E	O – E	(O – E) ²	$\frac{(O - E)^2}{E}$
Agree	255	135	120	14,400	106.67
Strongly agree	30	135	-105	11,025	81.67
Not decided	210	135	75	5,625	41.67
Disagree	150	135	15	225	1.67
Strongly disagree	30	135	-105	11,025	81.67
	675	675	0	42,300	313.35

From the above computation, the observed X² is 313.35. This result implies that there is significant relationship between the refund systems of ATM failed transaction and customer patronage of the selected banks (X²=313.35, df = 4, p=0.05). In other words, the null hypothesis was rejected with 95% level of confident.

V. Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations

5.0 Summary

This thesis includes the general introduction, the statement of the problems, objectives of the study purpose and significance of the study, research question, scope and limitation and definitions of terms, literature review, which is extracted from journals magazines and text books. The research methodology which has research design variable, population and sample, data collection instrument, method of data collection, mode of collection and analysis. The sample of 675 of bank customers drawn from all the 15 commercial banks operating in Maiduguri using questionnaires made up of 23 items. The analysis and interpretations of data reveal that most of the failed transaction occurred as a result of “cash out” lack of cash in the ATM’s or cash not loaded in the ATM. It was also discovered that ATM Network contributes immensely by debiting customer account and not dispensing the cash. It also reveals that customers lack awareness on the refund system; refunds are done on the domiciled bank. In respective of the terminal the customers perform the transaction which some customers shows their tendency of loosing that that amount is high there by affecting their moral whenever there

is failed transaction. The study also reveal that majority of the customers that experience ATM failure feel demoralized and believe that it takes several days for ATM failed transaction to be rectified, this places the customers in an awkward situation, especially where they have pressing needs to address with cash from the attempted withdrawal. The analysis also revealed that most customers are not satisfied with the refund system as only few customers are refunded automatically while other suffer delay in reversal of the transaction all these portend negative cognitive dissonance with regards to the services and hence the universal dissatisfaction with ATM services in Maiduguri

5.1 Conclusion

The study revealed that refund system in all the commercial banks are not uniform, the ATM's are not optimally functioning or maintained, thereby leading to the dispense error. The customers are not aware of the refund process leading to lost of their money from the malfunction of the automated teller machine. The study also reveal that the apex bank (CBN) and Inter switch Nigeria limited need to embark on more customers sensitization on the refund process of banks. No customer should lose money due to ATM failure. The CBN and Inter-switch should compare Nigerians current level of ATM refund to what is obtainable in the western world and if found wanting, should improve to international benchmark or standards. This is because if the present trend is not checkmated, this will affect customer moral there by affecting ATM acceptance which will affect the acceptance of cash less policy drive in the country as one of the alternative channels. The study also revealed that if commercial banks optimize their ATM channels, they can extend their reach to new customers who will visit their branch and contribute to their new revenue stream.

5.2 Recommendations

In the occurrence of ATM service failure include proper maintenance of ATMs to avoid fail transaction, faithfully implementation of ATM refund guideline reduced lead time in the refund process, prompt and polite attention to customer's complains improve on the inter switch for various card types and sustained sensitization company on the refund system. Other measures recommended preventing ATM service failure banks are expected to deploy some recovery measures not only to avoid litigation from customers but also to remain competitive in the industry. To this end, it should be noted that the customers most pressing concern is to see an effective and efficient ATM services in Maiduguri in order to mitigate the suffering on long queues and failed transactions and the most important recommendation are to ensure efficient network connectively, fully loaded ATM 24/7, availability of minted and sort fitted notes and wide spread availability of the ATMS. The role to be played in the ATM refunds by the apex bank (Central Bank of Nigeria) and Inter switch Nigeria Limited cannot be over emphasized. They should impose a stiff sanction on any commercial bank that failed to comply with the refund policy. They should stipulated standard date for the refund of each type of ATM failed transaction which when the affected banks failed to respond immediately, the complaining bank can debit them automatically necessary applications from the affected customers.

References

- [1]. Agboola, A. (2006) Information and Communication Technology (ICT) in Banking Operations in Nigeria An Evaluation of recent experiences. Retrieved December 25, 2007.
- [2]. Akpan, J. (2009) Cross Channel Integration and Optimization in Nigerian Banks Telnet Press release 20(1):1 – 4
- [3]. Business Dailies 9/02/2011 – CBN Section Banks for ATM Infraction
- [4]. CBN Guidelines on the use of ATM 2010
- [5]. David, W.H. (1986), Marketing High Technology: An Insider's Review. New York: Free Press.
- [6]. Fanawopo, S. (2006), World without Cash-Nigeria's Payment Card Grows Significantly. Retrieved October 15, 2007.
- [7]. Fasan, R. (2007), Banks Customers Relation and use of ATM Cards. Business Day Newspapers. Retrieved February 28, 2008.
- [8]. Garuba. A. O. (2008). Fundamentals of Banking, Vol.1 Benin Ambik Press Ltd. Ikhilae, E. (2010). Bank PHB Opposes CBN's Move to Free Self from ATM Fraud Suit. The Nation, July 5th, P25.
- [9]. John, T. (2008) Leading Empowered Team a Revised Edition of Service Quality Institute USA: MMVII
- [10]. Jun, M and Cai, S. (2001) The Key determinants of Internet Banking Service Quality: a Content Analysis International Journal of Banking Marketing 19(7): 276 – 291.
- [11]. Keystone Bank SOP on ATM Refund System – Reserved SOP 2009.
- [12]. Laderman, E. S. (1990). The Public Policy Implication of State Laws Pertaining to Automated Teller Machines. Federal Reserve Bank of San Francisco Economic Review, 1, 43-58.

- [13]. McAndrews, J.J. (2003), Automated Teller Machine Network Pricing – A Review of the Literature. Review of Network Economic, Federal Reserve Bank of New York 2(2) New York, USA.
- [14]. McCollough, M.A., L. L. Berry and M. S. Yadav (2000): “An Empirical Investigation of Customer Satisfaction after Service Failure and Recovery,” *Journal of Service Research*, Vol. 3, No. 2, November, Pp. 121-137
- [15]. Mishkin, F.S. (1998). *The Economics of Money, Banking and Financial Markets*. USA: Jeffrey Sylvester/FPG International Corporation.
- [16]. The Nation – ATM Banks stall CBN’s Refund Policy – 16/05/2011
- [17]. This Day Life: Cashless Policy; A Burden or a Relief? 25 April 2012 Views 19,125
- [18]. Peter, S.R. and Sylvia, C.H. (2008). *Bank Management and Financial Services*. New York: McGraw Hill/Irwin.
- [19]. Sarin, S., Sego, T. Chanvarasuth, N. (2003). Strategic Use of Bundling for Reducing Consumers’ Perceived Risk Associated with the Purchase of New High-Tech Products. *Journal of Marketing Theory and Practice*, 11(3):71-83.
- [20]. Wole, M.O. (2009). The Adoption of Automated Teller Machine in Nigeria; An Application of the Theory of Diffusion of Innovation Volume 6.
- [21]. Zeithaml, V.A. (1981), How Consumer Evaluation Processes Differ Between Goods and Services, in Donnelly, J.H., George, W.R. (Eds), *Marketing of Service*, Processing Series of the American Marketing Association